

RECEIVED  
UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN  
APR 10 1923

# The Classical Journal

PUBLISHED BY THE CLASSICAL ASSOCIATION OF THE MIDDLE WEST AND SOUTH  
WITH THE CO-OPERATION OF THE CLASSICAL ASSOCIATION OF NEW ENGLAND  
AND THE CLASSICAL ASSOCIATION OF THE PACIFIC STATES

Volume XVIII

APRIL 1923

Number 7

Editorial	385
E Pluribus Unum	M. E. Deutach 387
Artistic Translation as an Aid to English Composition	T. L. Bouscaren, S. J. 408
Some Teaching Devices for Latin	M. H. Alden 417
Notes	425
On Fossil Thunderstones and Fingerstones	E. S. McCartney
The Odes of Horace as Freshman Latin	C. P. Steinmetz
Priest-Kings	C. Murley
Current Events	428
Hints for Teachers	435
Book Reviews	441
<i>Römische Studien, Historisches, Epigraphisches, Literaturgeschichtliches aus vier Jahrhunderten Roms, Conrad Cichorius (A.E.R.B.); Vergil. A Biography, Tenney Frank (A.S.P.); First Latin, C. U. Clark and J. B. Game (G.A.S.).</i>	
Recent Books	447

THE TORCH PRESS  
CEDAR RAPIDS IOWA

THE CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS, LONDON  
THE MARUZEN-KABUSHIKI-KAISHA, TOKYO, OSAKA, KYOTO  
FUKUOKA, SENDAI  
THE MISSION BOOK COMPANY, SHANGHAI

# THE CLASSICAL JOURNAL

Published by the Classical Association of the Middle West and South, with the cooperation of the  
Classical Association of New England and the Classical Association of the Pacific States

## Managing Editors

FRANK J. MILLER  
The University of Chicago  
*For New England*  
HENRY N. DENNIS  
Smith College

ARTHUR T. WALLEN  
The University of Kansas  
*For the Pacific States*  
HERBERT C. NUTTING  
The University of California

## Associate Editors

CHARLES H. CHASE  
Harvard University  
JAMES W. LOUGHRAN  
East High School, Cleveland  
JAMES C. HANSEN  
University of Michigan

WALTER MILLER  
The University of Missouri  
JULIANNE A. BOILER  
Franklin High School, Portland, Ore.  
GEOFFREY HOWE  
University of North Carolina  
RICHARD L. ULLMAN  
University of Iowa

CLARENCE W. GLEASON  
Reedbury Latin School, Boston  
JOHN A. SCOTT  
Northwestern University  
WALTER A. EDWARDS  
Los Angeles High School, Los Angeles

The Classical Journal is published monthly except in July, August, and September by The Torch Press, Cedar Rapids, Iowa. The subscription price is \$2.50 per year; the price of single copies is 25 cents. Orders for service of less than a half-year will be charged at the single-copy rate. Postage is prepaid by the publishers on all orders from the United States, Mexico, Cuba, Porto Rico, Panama Canal Zone, Republic of Panama, Bolivia, Colombia, Honduras, Nicaragua, Peru, Hawaiian Islands, Philippine Islands, Guam, Samoa Islands, Shanghai. Postage is charged extra on orders. For Canada, 15 cents on annual subscriptions (total \$2.65); on single copies 5 cents (total 25 cents). For all other countries in the Postal Union, 25 cents on annual subscriptions (total \$2.75); on single copies 5 cents (total 30 cents).

Orders for missing numbers should be made within the month following the regular month of publication. The publishers expect to supply numbers free only when losses have been sustained in transit and when the reserve stock will permit.

Business communications should be addressed as follows:

1. Concerning membership in the Classical Association of the Middle West and South to BENJAMIN M. TANNER, Eastern University, Greenville, Ohio. The territory of the Association includes Alaska, Arkansas, Colorado, Florida, Georgia, Illinois, Indiana, Iowa, Kansas, Kentucky, Louisiana, Michigan, Minnesota, Mississippi, Missouri, Nebraska, New Mexico, North Carolina, North Dakota, Ohio, Oklahoma, South Carolina, South Dakota, Tennessee, Texas, Utah, Virginia, West Virginia, Wisconsin, Wyoming. The membership fee is \$2.00 per year to residents of this territory.

2. Concerning membership in the Classical Association of New England to MORRIS H. TANNER, Wakefield, Mass. The membership fee is \$2.50 per year to residents of this territory.

3. Concerning membership in the Classical Association of the Pacific States to JAMES T. ALLEN, University of California, Berkeley, Cal. The territory of this Association includes California, Oregon, Washington, Idaho, Montana, Nevada, and Arizona. The membership fee is \$2.00 per year to residents of this territory.

4. Concerning advertisements (not related to membership) to BENJAMIN M. TANNER, Eastern University, Greenville, Ohio.

5. Concerning advertising to C. E. WALLER, Business Manager, Iowa City, Iowa.

Communications for the Editors and correspondence should be sent either to FRANK J. MILLER, University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill., or to ARTHUR T. WALLEN, University of Kansas, Lawrence, Kan.; from New England contributors to HENRY N. DENNIS, Smith College, Northampton, Mass.; and from the Pacific States to HERBERT C. NUTTING, University of California, Berkeley, Cal.

Contributors' papers, if ordered in advance of publication, will be supplied to authors of major studies free.

Entered as second-class matter at the Post Office at Cedar Rapids, Iowa, on October 16, 1922, under Act of October 3, 1917. Acceptance for mailing at the special rate of Postage provided for in Section 1103, Act of October 3, 1917, authorized on October 15, 1922.

# THE CLASSICAL JOURNAL

VOLUME XVIII

APRIL, 1923

NUMBER 7

## Editorial

### SOME RECENT NOTABLE MOVEMENTS IN THE CLASSICAL FIELD

#### THE LOEB CLASSICAL LIBRARY

In an age when the Humanities are being neglected more perhaps than at any other time since the Middle Ages, and when men's minds are turning more than ever before to the practical and the material, it does not suffice to make pleas, however eloquent and convincing, for the safeguarding and further enjoyment of our greatest heritage from the past. Means must be found to place these treasures within the reach of all who care for the finer things of life. The mechanical and social achievements of our day must not blind our eyes to the fact that, in all that relates to man, his nature and aspirations, we have added little or nothing to what has been so finely said by the great men of old.

Such are the considerations which moved Mr. James Loeb to launch one of the most notable movements in the history of classical studies, a movement contemplating no less a task than the publication once more of the entire Greek and Latin classic texts with an accompanying translation by a modern specialist in each author.

Already, at the end of the first ten years since the Library was launched, notwithstanding the marked slowing up of its progress on account of the interruption of the war, 131 volumes have been published, 48 in Latin and 83 in Greek. These volumes represent, as wholly or only partially published, 28 Latin and 41 Greek authors. Seven other volumes are announced as ready shortly, and 21 volumes in Latin and 27 in Greek, are in preparation.

How wide circulation the Library has already found, we do not know. But some intimation of its success may be gained from the fact that 20 volumes in Latin and 16 in Greek have

already gone beyond the first edition; while 9 in Latin and 5 in Greek have gone into the third impression, and in some cases into the fourth and fifth. This looks like good progress, and we rejoice in the Library's early success.

But after all, that is a detail of secondary importance. The great thing is that the place of the Greek and Latin classics in English is guaranteed for all future generations. Men will turn to the classics because the door to this has been thrown wide open. A great series of translations has been produced by the best available scholars of this generation, and a library of a high grade of excellence is the result. These works will all stand high in the estimation of the future, and many will rank for all time as the final word in the translation of the given author.

This Library could not have been produced without these scholars. Neither could it have been produced without the vision and courage and efficient generosity of Mr. Loeb, our twentieth century Maecenas.



## E PLURIBUS UNUM

---

By MONROE E. DEUTSCH  
University of California

---

An American cannot fail to have at least some interest in the phrase *E Pluribus Unum*; it meets him in many different places as an official expression of our national unity. What was its source? How did it come to be employed as the motto of the United States? These are the questions which this paper will endeavor to answer.

*E Pluribus Unum* was first used as an official motto of the United States when it was adopted as part of the Great Seal of our nation. It is necessary, therefore, in making an investigation of the history of the phrase to devote attention first to the steps that led to the adoption of our national seal.

Late on the afternoon of July 4, 1776 (a day famous in the annals of our country), the following resolution was adopted by the Continental Congress: "Resolved, That Dr. Franklin, Mr. J. Adams and Mr. Jefferson be a committee to prepare a device for a Seal of the United States of America." These are illustrious names in the history of our nation; it will be recalled that the men designated were the three leading members of the committee of five that had drawn up the Declaration. The committee made its report on August 20, 1776,<sup>1</sup> a month and a half after its appointment. In this, the first recommendation concerning our national seal, appears the proposal: "Motto: *E Pluribus Unum*."

It should be said at this point that it is not the intention of this paper to trace the history of the various elements in our seal, but merely to follow the fortunes of our motto.

No action was taken on this report other than to lay it upon the

<sup>1</sup> This report is on file in the archives of the Department of State in Washington, and is endorsed: "No. 1. Copy of a Report made August 10, 1776." It will be noted that the date is incorrect and should be August 20.

table. In the years that followed, the matter of a seal was revived at intervals, and, in the course of the discussion, two new committees in turn were charged with the problem. The second definite proposal was not made until May 10, 1780; *E Pluribus Unum* had disappeared, the motto on the obverse being *Bello vel Paci* and on the reverse *virtute perennis*. This report, read May 17, was recommitted.

Again the decision as to our national seal rested, this time until May, 1782, when the third committee was appointed. They called upon the assistance of William Barton of Philadelphia, who had been a student of heraldry. In neither of the designs submitted by Barton did *E Pluribus Unum* appear. His second design was adopted by the committee and submitted as its recommendation on May 9, 1782. Congress did not, however, adopt it, but on June 13 referred the matter to Charles Thomson, its secretary; he proceeded energetically to work, and exactly one week later (June 20, 1782) our national seal was adopted.

Thomson modified Barton's second design, the one which the committee had formally recommended to Congress. For the reverse he adopted Barton's device, but changed the mottoes to *Audacibus annue coeptis* ("Favor the bold attempts"), Virgil, *Aeneid* IX, 625 and *Georgics* I, 40, and *Magnus ab integro seclorum nascitur ordo* ("The great series of ages begins anew"), Virgil, *Eclogue* IV, 5. The reverse (which is the only part of the seal now in use) differed in almost all respects from Barton's, and on this Thomson restored *E Pluribus Unum*. Barton made certain minor changes before the report was presented, and in this report, dated June 19, 1782, the mottoes on the reverse were curtailed to *Annuit Coeptis* and *Novus Ordo Seclorum*.

We find, therefore, that in the report of the first committee presented August 20, 1776, *E Pluribus Unum* appeared as a motto; it disappeared from all subsequent proposals for the seal until Charles Thomson, Secretary of Congress, restored it between June 13 and June 20, 1782, on which date our seal was adopted. Possibly the attentive secretary had been impressed by the first motto proposed, and when the matter was assigned to him, restored it.

It is, accordingly, necessary to return to the report of the first committee, composed of Franklin, Adams, and Jefferson, and endeavor to ascertain how the phrase came to appear in that report. There is extant an interesting letter from John Adams to his wife, dated Philadelphia, 14 August, 1776,<sup>2</sup> which throws considerable light on the work of that committee. It will be noted that the letter was written while the committee was in the midst of its labors. The pertinent passages are as follows: "I am put upon a committee . . . to prepare devices for a great seal for the confederated States. There is a gentleman here of French extraction, whose name is Du Simitiere, a painter by profession, whose designs are very ingenious, and his drawings well executed. He has been applied to for his advice. I waited on him yesterday, and saw his sketches. . . . For the seal, he proposes the arms of the several nations from whence America has been peopled, as English, Scotch, Irish, Dutch, German, etc., each in a shield. On one side of them, Liberty with her pileus, on the other, a rifler in his uniform, with his rifle-gun in one hand and his tomahawk in the other; this dress and these troops, with the kind of armor, being peculiar to America, unless the dress was known to the Romans. Dr. Franklin showed me yesterday a book containing an account of the dresses of all the Roman soldiers, one of which appeared exactly like it. . . . Dr. F. Proposes a device for a seal: Moses lifting up his wand and dividing the Red Sea, and Pharaoh in his chariot overwhelmed with the waters. This motto, "Rebellion to tyrants is obedience to God." Mr. Jefferson proposed the children of Israel in the wilderness, led by a cloud by day and a pillar of fire by night; and on the other side, Hengist and Horsa, the Saxon chiefs from whom we claim the honor of being descended, and whose political principles and form of government we have assumed. I proposed the choice of Hercules, as engraved by Gribelin, in some editions of Lord Shaftesbury's works. The hero resting on his club; Virtue pointing to her rugged mountain on one hand, and persuading him to ascend; Sloth, glancing at her flowery paths of pleasure, wantonly

<sup>2</sup> Charles Francis Adams, *Familiar Letters of John Adams and his Wife, Abigail Adams, during the Revolution* (New York, 1876), p. 210.

reclining on the ground, displaying the charms both of her eloquence and person, to seduce him into vice. But this is too complicated a group for a seal or medal, and it is not original."

This letter, it will be noted, was written August 14, 1776; as the report of the committee was presented August 20, 1776, it is obvious that the recommendation must have been agreed upon in a period of less than a week. It is interesting to observe that of the proposals of Adams and Jefferson, as described in this letter, not the slightest detail was employed in the report of the first committee, whereas Franklin's proposal was accepted in its entirety, including the motto he suggested, for one side of the seal. It was for the other side of the seal that *E Pluribus Unum* was proposed as the motto.

In the Jefferson papers in the Library of Congress is a description of the seal almost identical with that approved by the committee, and this, it is believed, is in the handwriting of Du Simitiere, mentioned in Adams' letter; the sketch accompanying it, which shows the motto *E Pluribus Unum*, is doubtless his work. We have, accordingly, four persons, one of whom must have suggested the phrase to the committee; these are obviously Franklin, Adams, Jefferson, and Du Simitiere.

Leaving for the time the question of the individual who may have proposed the motto, let us now take up the consideration of the various sources hitherto suggested. It has been urged (and quite frequently) that our motto comes from Virgil's *Moretum* (verse 103), wherein appear the words *color est e pluribus unus*. This passage deals with the making of a salad, and is thus translated by H. R. Fairclough:<sup>3</sup> "Round and round passes the hand; little by little the elements lose their peculiar strength; the many colors blend into one."

The objections to believing that this is the source of our motto are: (1) the phrase is actually *e pluribus unus*, (2) the word *color* is an essential part of the sentence, (3) the idea in the *Moretum* is not one likely to imbed itself in the mind, (4) the *Moretum* is and was little read and quoted, and (5) the thought of a "salad of states" hardly seems a happy or appropriate one, or one likely

<sup>3</sup> *Vergil*, vol. II, in the *Loeb Classical Library*.

to seem so to men who had completed the Declaration of Independence but a month and a half before.

A second theory takes us to St. Augustine. In his *Confessions* (IV, 8) he says: "flagrare animos et ex pluribus unum facere." The idea is certainly on a loftier plane, but we have not the slightest evidence that any one of the four had the phrase in mind at that time or, indeed, at any other.

A third theory recalls the fact that the motto of the *Spectator* for August 20, 1711, was *Exempta juvat spinis e pluribus una*.<sup>4</sup> This is a modification of Horace *Epistles* II, 2.212, which is now read: "Quid te exempta levat spinis de pluribus una?" Conington translates it: "Where is the gain in pulling from the mind one thorn, if all the rest remain behind?" Clearly Horace and the *Spectator* mean "one selected from many," not "one composed of many"; moreover, the colonies would hardly appear to men like Franklin, Adams, and Jefferson, thorns to be removed. And, as in the case of the other suggestions, we have not a shred of proof that the passage in the *Spectator* was the source of our motto.

The suggestion of Powers in the *Overland Monthly* that the phrase came from a Latin poem by John Carey of Philadelphia entitled "The Pyramid of Fifteen States," is, as has been pointed out, overthrown by the very title of Carey's poem, which indicates that it was written when there were fifteen states, i. e., after the addition of Vermont and Kentucky to the original thirteen.

The theory most often advanced, however, and which is, in my opinion, exceedingly well grounded, is that our motto comes directly from the legend printed on the title-page of the *Gentleman's Magazine*. This publication was issued in London, the printer and publisher being Edw. Cave, Jr., but employing the pseudonym "Sylvanus Urban, Gent." The first volume appeared in 1731. On the title-page of this magazine was a drawing of a hand holding a bouquet of flowers, to the left of the bouquet being the words "Prodesse et Delectare" and to the right "E Pluribus Unum." The former phrase is undoubtedly derived from Horace's *Ars Poetica*, verse 333: "Aut prodesse volunt aut delectare

<sup>4</sup> This is the reading in "The *Spectator*," volume second, London, MDCCLIV.



poetae." The other motto, *E Pluribus Unum*, which the *Gentleman's Magazine* used for over a century (save for the years 1789 to 1794) was without question taken in its turn from the *Gentleman's Journal or the Monthly Miscellany*, a publication issued in London from 1691 to 1694, of which the editor was Pierre Antoine Motteux, a Huguenot refugee. Motteux is of some note in the history of literature, particularly as the translator of *Don Quixote*.<sup>5</sup> It has been charged that nowhere in the *Gentleman's Magazine* was there any acknowledgment of the fact that the bouquet and motto had been derived from the *Gentleman's Journal*. There is, however, a very explicit acknowledgment (tardy though it be) in the *Gentleman's Magazine* 3rd N. S. 1 (1856), page 9, where in the *Autobiography of Sylvanus Urban* (the founder) we read: "A typical device was added being a hand holding a nosegay of flowers with the motto 'E Pluribus Unum'— which device, I may inform you, was directly copied from the bouquet which Peter Motteux had displayed, with the same motto, in his *Gentleman's Journal*." Motteux first used it in the number of his journal for January, 1692, and continued to employ it till the last number, November, 1694.

The sense which Motteux gave to the motto (he printed it with a comma between *pluribus* and *unum*) is indicated in his magazine for January, 1692: "That which is prefixed to this *Miscellany*, among other things, implies that tho' only one of the many Pieces in it were acceptable, it might gratify every reader. So I may venture to crowd in what follows, as a Cowslip and a Dazy among the Lillies and the Roses."<sup>6</sup> Clearly then, Motteux meant "one selected from among many."

However, in the *Gentleman's Magazine* for 1734, the introductory poem, dealing with the motto *E Pluribus Unum*, shows a different meaning for the phrase. It closes thus:

"To your motto most true, for our monthly inspection,  
You mix various rich sweets in *one* fragrant collection."

Here, clearly, the interpretation is "one composed of many."

<sup>5</sup> On Motteux see the *Cambridge History of English Literature*, IX, 256, 263, 270-2.

<sup>6</sup> Arnold, *Historic Side-lights*, 291-2.

The *Gentleman's Magazine*, founded forty-five years before the report of the first committee on our national seal, was undoubtedly well-known in the colonies, and the phrase on the title-page was, we may assume, likewise well-known. The question naturally arises: "How did the committee come to use a phrase of such origin and such association as a motto applied to the colonies welded into one nation?"

Of course, there are a number of phrases easily to be found in Latin literature, among them some in so well known an author as Cicero, in which appears the thought of making one out of many and, in particular, in relation to friendship. Thus in *De Amicitia* 21.81 we read *ut efficiat paene unum ex duobus*, and somewhat later in the same essay (25.92) *cum amicitiae vis sit in eo, ut unus quasi animus fiat ex pluribus*. And in *De Officiis* (I, 17.56) Cicero says: "Efficiturque id, quod Pythagoras vult in amicitia ut unus fiat ex pluribus."<sup>7</sup> Though these give us the meaning "one formed out of many" and deal with friendship, so closely related to a union of states, still there is not the slightest hint that any one of them was in the minds of the committee.

There is, however, in existence, a letter which, it seems to me, may have some bearing upon the restoration of the phrase in 1782. The letter is one written by Charles Thomson to William Barton, and is dated June 24, 1782, i. e., four days after Congress adopted the Great Seal with the motto *E Pluribus Unum*. It reads as follows: "Sir,—I am much obliged for the perusal of the elements of Heraldry which I now return. I have just dipt into it so far as to be satisfied that it may afford a fund of entertainment and may be applied by a State to useful purposes. I am much obliged for your very valuable present of Fortescue 'De Laudibus Legum Angliae,' and shall be happy to have it in my power to make a suitable return. I enclose a copy of the Device by which you have displayed your skill in heraldic science, and which meets general approbation. I am, sir, your obedient humble servant, (signed) Chas. Thomson. June 24, 1782."<sup>8</sup>

<sup>7</sup> Cf. also Hieron. *ep.* 83: "quasi unus in pluribus es, ut sis unus ex pluribus."—The reverse of our phrase is to be found in Cic. *De Natura Deorum* II, 127: "ut ex uno plura generentur."

<sup>8</sup> *Proceedings of Massachusetts Historical Society*, 1866-7, pp. 351-2.

This letter is of very great interest; the fact that the writer and recipient were the two persons who had most to do with the Seal adopted and that the letter was written but four days after that adoption, first attract attention. Then one notes that the last sentence deals very directly with the seal; the first and second sentences relating to the elements of heraldry are likewise seen to be concerned with it, especially in view of the reference to heraldic science in the last sentence. That leaves the third sentence as having apparently nothing to do with the seal and breaking the connection of thought between the two opening sentences and the last sentence. Anything is possible in letter-writing, but somehow such an arrangement in a letter of four sentences, written at the very time when the preparation of the seal was uppermost in the minds of both, rouses one's curiosity, to say the least.

Accordingly, I turned to Fortescue's work and quickly found in chapter XIII the following: "Quo, primo Polit. dicit Philosophus 'Quod quandocunque ex pluribus constituitur unum inter illa, unum erit Regens, et alia erunt recta'." This is translated: "Wherefore, the philosopher, in the first of his politics, says 'Whensoever a multitude is formed into one body or society, one part must govern, and the rest be governed'." Here we find the words *ex pluribus constituitur unum*, meaning "one formed out of many," dealing with government, and found in so respectable an author as Fortescue. This may of course be a mere coincidence, but if so, it is an exceedingly strange one.

It seems to me that the restoration of *E Pluribus Unum* at the very time Fortescue was passing from Barton to Thomson may well have received some impetus from this phrase quoted by Fortescue from "the philosopher." By "the philosopher" (as is made clear by the beginning of chapter VIII) Fortescue means Aristotle. And turning to the latter's Politics (I, 5.3) we readily find the passage employed by Fortescue, which is translated by W. E. Bolland as follows: "For whenever there is a combination of several parts, and one common result arising from it, whether those parts be continuous or distinct, there is in all cases apparent the element which rules and that which is ruled." Fortescue's

phrase, therefore, goes back to ἐκ πλειόνων . . . ἐν of Aristotle. And in Thomson's restoration of *E Pluribus Unum* this quotation seems to me in all likelihood to have had some weight.

But after all Thomson merely restored what the first committee had proposed, and while it is of interest to learn that Fortescue's use of a phrase from Aristotle played some part in that restoration, yet the proposal itself was made in the period between August 14 and August 20, 1776, and to that time and the original committee we shall accordingly return.

The honor of proposing the phrase must, as we have seen, be given to one of these four — Du Simitiere, Adams, Jefferson, or Franklin. It is indeed true that the sketch of the obverse of the seal found in the Jefferson papers not only is undoubtedly the work of Du Simitiere but also is identical with the seal recommended by the first committee with the substitution in the latter of the figure of Justice for Du Simitiere's "rifler." And in this sketch we find the motto *E Pluribus Unum*. From this fact it has been strongly urged that it was Du Simitiere who proposed the motto.

The question at once arises: "Is this the sketch which Adams described in his letter of August 14, 1776?" If so, it would seem exceedingly strange that he did not mention this motto in his letter written the day after seeing it, though in that very letter he cites the motto Franklin had proposed. Moreover, in Du Simitiere's sketch also appears "the Eye of Providence," to which Adams makes no reference in his letter. In passing, it is of interest to note that the only portions of the report of the first committee which became part of our national seal are the motto *E Pluribus Unum* and the eye of Providence, the only features of importance in that report whose originator is not definitely stated.

As one looks at Du Simitiere's sketch,<sup>9</sup> he finds it impossible to believe that Adams would not have referred to these two features, had the sketch been the one he saw the day before. One is far more inclined to believe that after meeting Adams and the other members of the committee (i. e., after August 14), Du

<sup>9</sup> Arnold, *Historic Side-lights*, opposite page 282.

Simitiere drew the sketch referred to, adding the motto either on his own volition or on the suggestion of another.

Obviously, the fact that the motto appears on Du Simitiere's sketch does not prove that the person who drew the sketch, proposed the motto. In the first place, the omission of any mention of the motto or the eye of Providence from Aadms' account, seems to me to make it very unlikely that this was the sketch he had seen on August 13. If it was not, and if it was drawn between August 14 and August 20, it is at least equally probable that Du Simitiere added to his sketch the motto another had proposed. In the second place, we have an interesting sidelight in reference to the design which Du Simitiere prepared for the seal of Virginia, apparently also in August, 1776. Two possible mottoes were proposed for it, the sketch reading: "Rebellion to tyrants is obedience to God; or Rex est qui regem non habet (suggested by Mr. Jefferson)." <sup>10</sup> It is here definitely stated that the motto was suggested to Du Simitiere by another; the first motto, it will be noted, is, moreover, the one which Franklin proposed that very month as the motto for the seal of the United States.

After all, it seems less likely that Du Simitiere, a foreigner and "a painter by profession," should have taken upon himself the responsibility of proposing a motto for the seal of the United States than that, as in case of Virginia, he should have incorporated in his sketch the suggestion of another. We must then turn to the three members of the committee.

John Adams taught school and studied law in Worcester from 1756 to 1758 and, interestingly enough, in a list of works dealing with the law that he read at that time, he names Fortescue.<sup>11</sup> However, that was twenty years before the date of the report of the committee on the seal, and apparently Fortescue made no greater impression on him than the other books in the list. But it is important to observe that the notion of the need of a union among the colonies was already a firm conviction on his part. He wrote on October 12, 1755: "The only way to keep us from setting up for ourselves is to disunite us. *Divide et impera.*" <sup>12</sup>

<sup>10</sup> Burk, *History of Virginia*, vol. IV, appendix 14.

<sup>11</sup> Charles Francis Adams, *The Works of John Adams*, I, 46.

<sup>12</sup> *Ibid.*, I, 23.



Jefferson has often been mentioned as the person who proposed the motto. There is, however, not a shred of proof in any account that has come to my notice. It is clear that he was very much interested in mottoes. We have already seen that he suggested a motto for Virginia. In a letter to John Page (1776)<sup>13</sup> he discusses another motto proposed for that state. He says: "But for God's sake what is the 'Deus nobis haec otia fecit!' It puzzles everybody here. If my country really enjoys that otium it is singular, as every other Colony seems to be hard struggling. . . . This device is too enigmatical. Since it puzzles now, it will be absolutely insoluble fifty years hence."<sup>14</sup>

Not only did mottoes interest him, but he, too, had again and again stressed the idea of unity. Thus he said: "The States should be one as to everything connected with foreign relations, and several as to everything purely domestic."<sup>15</sup>

There is, moreover, an incident which shows: (1) that Jefferson's mind had for some time been busy with the matter of a seal and, in particular, with a motto for it, and (2) that the idea of a union as a source of strength had been its main feature. For in 1774 he made this note in his almanac: "A proper device (instead of arms) for the American states united would be the Father presenting the bundle of rods to his sons. The motto 'Insuperabiles si inseparabiles' an answer given in parl[iament] to the H[ouse] of Lds, and commons."<sup>16</sup> The reference is to the fable, found in Aesop, of the father who makes clear to his sons their individual weakness and their collective strength by showing them how easily single rods can be broken, while the utmost strength cannot break them if bound together. But nothing direct has thus far been brought forward connecting Jefferson with our national motto.

Let us now turn to the third member of the committee, Benjamin Franklin. It was he, it will be recalled, who proposed the design and the motto accepted by the committee for the other side of the seal; it will also be recalled that the designs which we

<sup>13</sup> P. L. Ford, *Writings of Jefferson* (1892), II, 70.

<sup>14</sup> See also *ibid.*, II, 70.

<sup>15</sup> Arnold, *Historic Side-lights*, 267.

<sup>16</sup> P. L. Ford, *Writings of Jefferson* (1892), I, 420.

know for certain were proposed by Adams and Jefferson were entirely rejected.

It does not, to be sure, demand a knowledge of Latin for one to suggest a Latin motto; it is, however, of interest to ascertain whether Franklin had any knowledge of the language. In his *Autobiography*<sup>17</sup> he says: "I have already mentioned that I had only one year's instruction in a Latin school, and that when very young, after which I neglected that language entirely. But, when I had attained an acquaintance with the French, Italian, and Spanish, I was surpriz'd to find on looking over a Latin Testament, that I understood so much more of that language than I had imagined, which encouraged me to apply myself again to the study of it, and I met with more success, as those preceding languages had greatly smooth'd my way."

Latin phrases and quotations occur not infrequently in Franklin's writings, particularly in the earlier ones; among the authors cited one notes Cicero, Terence, Sallust, Seneca, Livy, Persius, Horace, and Virgil. On the use of such quotations we have an interesting expression on Franklin's part in the editorial preface to the *New England Courant* no. 80, 1723:<sup>18</sup> "Gentle Readers, we design never to let a Paper pass without a Latin Motto if we can possibly pick one up, which carries a Charm in it to the Vulgar, and the learned admire the pleasure of Construing. We should have obliged the World with a Greek scrap or two, but the Printer has no Types, and therefore we intreat the candid Reader not to impute the defect to our Ignorance, for our Doctor can say all the Greek Letters by heart."

That Franklin had paid attention to mottoes embodying the idea of union, is made evident by an article in the *Pennsylvania Gazette* for May 9, 1754; at the end of the article is a wood-cut, in which is the figure of a snake, separated into parts, to each of which is affixed the initial of one of the colonies, and at the bottom in large capital letters the motto "*Join or Die*."<sup>19</sup>

<sup>17</sup> Albert Henry Smyth, *The Writings of Benjamin Franklin*, I, 347.

<sup>18</sup> *Ibid.*, II, 52.

<sup>19</sup> Jared Sparks, *The Works of Benjamin Franklin* (1890), III, 25. The cut is reproduced on page 418 of *The Many-sided Franklin* by Paul Leicester Ford, 1899.

Granted that Franklin had some knowledge of Latin, that he used Latin quotations, and that the idea of a union of the colonies had for a number of years been present in his mind; the important question still remains: Did Franklin have an intimate knowledge of the *Gentleman's Magazine* and, consequently, of the motto on its title page?

In the first place, articles of his frequently appeared in it. With no attempt to give a complete list of his contributions the following may be cited as illustrations:

Letter to Sir Hans Sloane on Asbestos, dated June 2, 1725:

*G. M.*, September, 1780.

Letter on the Electrical Kite read at the Royal Society, December 21, 1752: *G. M.*, December, 1752.

An Act for the better ordering and regulating such as are willing and desirous to be united for military purposes within the province of Pennsylvania: *G. M.*, February, 1756.

Dialogue between X, Y, and Z, concerning the present state of affairs in Pennsylvania: *G. M.*, March, 1756.

An Edict by the King of Prussia, Dantzic, September 5, (1773): *G. M.*, October, 1773.

Rules by which a great empire may be reduced to a small one: *G. M.*, September, 1773.

In the second place, Franklin refers often to both the *Gentleman's Magazine* and Cave, its publisher. In his Autobiography<sup>20</sup> he writes: "Mr. Collinson then gave them (i. e., the papers on electricity) to Cave for publication in his *Gentleman's Magazine*, but he chose to print them separately in a pamphlet, and Dr. Fothergill wrote the preface. Cave, it seems, judged rightly for his profit, for by the additions that arrived afterward, they swell'd, to a quarto volume, which has had five editions, and cost him nothing for copy-money." In a letter of September 14, 1752,<sup>21</sup> we read: "I see by Cave's Magazine for May, that they have translated my electrical papers into French and printed

<sup>20</sup> Smyth, I, 418.

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid.*, III, 97-8.

them in Paris."<sup>22</sup> His connection continued until his last years, for we find a letter of his dated October 20, 1789, addressed to Sylvanus Urban, Esq. (the pseudonym of the editor) and beginning: "In your valuable magazine for July, 1788, I find a review of Dr. Kippis' 'Life of Cook' <sup>23</sup> . . . ." His continuous attention to it is shown by another letter of 1789,<sup>24</sup> in which he says: "Whoever compares a volume of the *Gentleman's Magazine*, printed between the years 1731 and 1740, with one of those printed in the last ten years, will be convinced of the much greater Degree of Perspicuity given by black Ink than by Grey."

On the other hand, the interest in Dr. Franklin on the part of the editor of the *Gentleman's Magazine*<sup>25</sup> and his high respect for Franklin are attested in the number for July, 1767. In it appears the "Examination of Dr. Franklin in the British House of Commons respecting the Stamp Act," and concerning it the editor says: "The questions in general are put with great subtilty and judgment, and they are answered with such deep and familiar knowledge of the subject, such precision and perspicuity, such temper and yet such spirit, as do the greatest honor to Dr. Franklin and justify the general opinion of his character and abilities."

Another compliment is paid to him in the poem introductory to volume 23 of the *Magazine* (1753), which reads in part as follows:

"The maid (i. e., America) new paths in science tries,  
New gifts her daring toil supplies;  
She gordian knots of art unbinds;  
The Thunder's secret source she finds;  
With rival pow'r her light'nings fly,  
Her skill disarms the frowning sky;  
For this the minted gold she claims,  
Ordain'd the meed of gen'rous aims."

<sup>22</sup> For other references see *ibid.*, III, 57-8; III, 105-6; III, 133; III, 263; IV, 3, and V, 146.

<sup>23</sup> *Ibid.*, X, 43.

<sup>24</sup> *Ibid.*, X, 80.

<sup>25</sup> The *Gentleman's Magazine* contains many references to Franklin, the index listing forty-nine appearances of his name. The most interesting is probably that in LX, 571, where there is a long account of his life together with numerous references to earlier volumes of the *Magazine*.

And that no one should fail to understand these lines, the following footnote appears: "Benjamin Franklyn, Esq; of Philadelphia, in America, obtained the Royal Society's medal for his amazing discoveries in Electricity, an account of which first came into our hands."

That Franklin was well acquainted with the magazine, and that his writings and his name appeared often in its pages is, I think, sufficiently clear. Indeed, Franklin's correspondence makes it evident that negotiations were under way for him to serve as its agent in America. In a letter to William Strahan, dated Philadelphia, November 27, 1755,<sup>26</sup> he writes: "I shall be glad to be of any service to you in the affair you mention relating to the *Gentleman's Magazine*, and our daughter (who already trades a little in London) is willing to undertake the distributing of them per post from this place, hoping it may produce some profit to herself. I will immediately cause advertisements to be printed in the papers here, at New York, New Haven, and Boston, recommending that magazine and proposing to supply all who will subscribe for them at 13s. this currency, a year, the subscribers paying down the money for one year beforehand; for otherwise there will be considerable loss by bad debts. As soon as I find out what the subscription will produce I shall know what number to send for. Most of those for New England must be sent to Boston. Those for New York, Connecticut, Pennsylvania, and Maryland must be sent to New York or Philadelphia, as opportunities offer to one place or the other. As to Virginia, I believe it will scarce be worth while to propose it there, the gentlemen being generally furnished with them by their correspondents in London. Those who incline to continue, must pay for the second year three months before the first expires, and so on from time to time. The postmaster in those places to take in the subscription money and distribute the magazines, etc. These are my first thoughts. I shall write further. That magazine has always been, in my opinion, by far the best. I think it never wants matter, both entertaining and instructive, or I might now and then furnish you

<sup>26</sup> Smyth, III, 303.



with some little pieces from this part of the world." Again in a letter of July 2, 1756,<sup>27</sup> Franklin discusses with Strahan his "scheme of circulating your magazine"; it is thought, however, that the plan was not carried out.

There is a final and most important tie. Benjamin Mecom, Franklin's nephew, began on August 31, 1758, the publication of *The New England Magazine of Knowledge and Pleasure*; it lived but a few months. But two copies are said to be in existence,<sup>28</sup> one being a copy of the first number; in both of these we find on the title-page the familiar bouquet of the *Gentleman's Magazine*, and both of the mottoes which had appeared with it, *Prodesse & Delectare*, and *E Pluribus Unum*. Below them (in the October number) appears the couplet:

Alluring Profit with Delight we blend;  
One, out of many, to the Public send.

Not only did the bouquet and the two mottoes come from the *Gentleman's Magazine* but Mecom also used the name of Urbanus Filter, clearly derived from Sylvanus Urban of the English magazine.

We see, accordingly, that Franklin wrote frequently for the *Gentleman's Magazine*, referred often to it in his letters, and was often, referred to in its pages and in a most complimentary manner. He thought very highly of it; he said "(it) has always been, in my opinion, by far the best." In fact negotiations were entered on to have him act as its American agent. His nephew in publishing the *New England Magazine* shows his indebtedness to the *Gentleman's Magazine* in a number of ways, one of which is the use of *E Pluribus Unum* as a motto on the title-page.

Is it not, then, natural to infer that Franklin proposed this motto, which was used on the title-page of every issue of a magazine which he knew and esteemed so highly?

But it may be asked: "Does it seem probable that Franklin would have proposed for the national motto a scrap of a phrase found on the title-page of a magazine along with *Prodesse et Delectare* and a bouquet of flowers, a phrase having no noble

<sup>27</sup> *Ibid.*, III, 337-8.

<sup>28</sup> Arnold, *Historic Side-lights*, 63.

associations, and, in particular, identified with an English publication?"

As to the first of these, Franklin would not, I believe, have had any scruples. If the phrase met his needs, he would use it. The motto which we are certain he proposed for the seal ("Rebellion to tyrants is obedience to God") is to be found in an article entitled "Bradshaw's Epitaph," published in the *Pennsylvania Evening Post* on December 14, 1775. The article is anonymous, but it is agreed that it is Franklin's. In the article it is stated that this phrase was part of the epitaph of John Bradshaw, one of the judges who sentenced Charles I. This it certainly was not, but, instead, indubitably the creation of Benjamin Franklin himself.<sup>29</sup> If, then, it is clear that Franklin proposed a line of such a history for the nation's motto, it hardly seems likely that he would have hesitated to use a phrase that satisfied him, merely because it appeared on the title-page of a magazine.

But, it may be urged, that the magazine was English would surely have made it unwelcome to the Americans. Possibly it would have done so under ordinary conditions. There is, however, a poem which introduces volume 45 (1775) and which, therefore, must have been written at the end of that year, that, I believe must have so kindled the hopes and fiered the ardor of the Americans that the motto of the magazine containing it would not only have been tolerated but even welcomed. This poem, we must remember, could not have reached the American colonies before the early part of 1776. It is "Addressed to Mr. Urban on completing the XLVth Volume of the *Gentleman's Magazine*:"

Close, Urban, close th' historic page  
Disgraced with more than civil rage;  
And may our annals never tell  
To that dire rage what victims fell!  
Let dark oblivion hide the plain  
O'erspread with heaps of Britons slain;  
Friends, brothers, parents, in the blood  
Of brothers, friends, and sons imbrued!

\* \* \* \* \*

<sup>29</sup> *Ibid.*, 238 foll.; Hunt, *The History of the Seal of the United States*, 14-16.

Griev'd at the past, yet more we fear  
 The horrors of the coming year,  
 Ships sunk or plunder'd, slaughter'd hosts,  
 Towns burnt, and desolated coasts.  
 Yet, sever'd by th' Atlantic main,  
 Though great, our efforts must be vain;  
 Resources so remote must fail,  
 Nor skill nor valor can prevail:  
 When winds, waves, elements are foes,  
 In vain all human means oppose.

At length, when all these contests cease,  
 And Britain weary'd rests in peace,  
 Our sons, beneath yon Western skies  
 Shall see one vast republic rise;  
 Another Athens, Sparta, Rome  
 Shall there unbounded sway assume;  
 Thither her ball shall Empire roll,  
 And Europe's pamper'd states controul,  
 Though Xerxes rul'd and lash'd the sea,  
 The Greeks of old thus would be free;  
 Nor could the power and wealth of Spain  
 Th' United Netherlands regain.

Think what such a glowing prophecy must have meant to the struggling colonies. Hesitation to accept a motto because it stood on the title-page of the magazine which had published this tribute and exhortation, would surely have been far from their minds.

And so our motto, selected between August 14 and August 20, 1776, was unquestionably taken from the title-page of the *Gentleman's Magazine*. And the evidence is overwhelming that the suggestion came from Benjamin Franklin, who was so closely bound to the *Magazine* by numerous ties. And the poem which was introductory to the volume of 1775 must have given added strength to such a proposal and cleared away any doubts as to the propriety of its selection.

From the *Gentleman's Magazine* we trace *E Pluribus Unum* back to the second volume of the *Gentleman's Journal*, a magazine published in London from 1691 to 1694 by Motteux, the Hugue-

not refugee. Its first known appearance is accordingly on the title-page of the *Journal* for 1692. Whether Motteux found it in some work or composed it himself, we can but surmise. The only evidence upon this question is in Motteux' own words. On page 19 of the number of the *Gentleman's Journal* for January, 1692, he discusses "devices" and the mottoes used with them; after some mention of those of various academies he continues:<sup>30</sup> "Which Devises (by the way) are a kind of Poetry which we do not derive from the Ancients, for the Hieroglyphics of the Egyptians were at best only half or imperfect Devises, and Bodies without Souls; whereas regular Devises sometimes express more in one word, than doth a volume. But there is a great deal of Wit requir'd to find out Subjects proper for the Body of a Devise, and Words or a Soul suitable to it. But of these I hope to treat in some of my next.

"That which is prefix'd to this Miscellany, among other things, implies that tho' only one of the many Pieces in it were acceptable, it might gratify every Reader. So I may venture to crowd in what follows, as a Cowslip and a Dazy among the Lillies and the Roses."

While there is of course nothing explicit in all this, still the impression it leaves is that Motteux had himself composed the motto or adapted it. And of all the phrases resembling our national motto that have been found in classical authors, that in Horace's *Epistles* II, 2.212 seems to me by far the most likely to have been the one modified by Motteux. It will be recalled that all our editions read: "Quid te exempta levat spinis de pluribus una?" But, as we have already seen, it is to be found in the *Spectator* for August 20, 1711, in the form *e pluribus una*, a very simple and natural modification. The phrase *e pluribus una* is almost as near our motto as that in the *Moretum*; we must, moreover, recall that Motteux clearly meant "one selected from among many," which is the meaning of the Horatian passage, but not of that in the *Moretum*. Horace was read and quoted with the utmost frequency, and, as we have noted, this very verse was the

<sup>30</sup> Arnold, *Historic Side-lights*, 288, and reproduction of page 19 of the *Gentleman's Journal*.

motto for one of the numbers of the *Spectator*. And, interestingly enough, the words *Prodesse et Delectare* added as a second motto in the *Gentleman's Magazine* to accompany *E Pluribus Unum* were unquestionably drawn from Horace's *Ars Poetica*, the poem immediately following the second book of his *Epistles*. It seems to me, therefore, not unlikely that *E Pluribus Unum* is Motteux' adaptation of *e (or de) pluribus una*, Horace, *Epistle II*, 2.212.

In short, our national motto is undoubtedly drawn from the phrase used on the title-page of the *Gentleman's Magazine* which in its turn obtained it from the *Gentleman's Journal* (1692-1694). There our knowledge ceases, but it may easily be that Motteux, the editor of the *Gentleman's Journal*, adapted it from Horace *Epistle II*, 2.212. And so a Frenchman adapted and published on the title-page of a magazine issued in England a group of three Latin words which became the national motto of this composite people, the United States of America.

#### BIBLIOGRAPHY

- ADAMS, CHARLES FRANCIS. Familiar Letters of John Adams and his Wife Abigail Adams, during the Revolution (pp. 210-211). New York; Hurd and Houghton, 1876.
- ARNOLD, HOWARD PAYSON. Historic Side-lights (especially pp. 279-315 and pp. 63-66); (by far the best and most complete discussion of the subject; many of his conclusions are accepted in this article).
- CHAMPLIN, J. D. JR. The Great Seal of the United States [in *Galaxy* 23:691-4].
- Chautauquan* 31:321-2 (1900); (based entirely on Arnold's *Historic Side-lights*).
- FORTESCUE. De Laudibus Legum Angliae (The Translation into English published A. D. MDCCLXXV and the original Latin Text with Notes) by A. Amos (Cambridge, 1825), pp. 220-221 and 37.
- The Gentleman's Magazine or Monthly Intelligencer*, London. 1731 and following volumes.
- GREEN, SAMUEL A. Origin of E Pluribus Unum [in *American Journal of Numismatics*, V (1870). 27].



- Green Bag* 14:440; (an article quoted from the *Boston Herald*).  
*Historical Magazine* III, April, 1859, p. 121 and August, 1859, p. 255.
- HUNT, GAILLARD. The History of the Seal of the United States. Washington, D. C.; Department of State, 1909 (a work of great value).
- LANDER, E. T. The Great Seal of the United States [in *Magazine of American History* 29 (1893), 471].  
*Lippincott's Magazine*, February, 1868. (A mere reference to the *Moretum*.)
- LLOYD, J. W. "The Great Seal of the United States" [in *St. Nicholas* 33:790-1 (1906)] (a popular account).
- LOSSING, B. J. In *Harper's Magazine* XIII (July, 1856), 178-186.  
*Magazine of American History* 2.2 (1878), p. 636.  
*Massachusetts Historical Society, Proceedings*, 1873-75, p. 39; 1866-7, p. 351.  
*Modern Language Association Publications* 32 (1917), 22-58.
- POWERS, STEPHEN. Picking Historical Marrow-bones [in *Overland Monthly*, VI, 271-9 (March, 1871)].
- PREBLE, GEORGE HENRY. History of the American Flag (pp. 683-696). (Second revised edition, Boston, 1880.)
- SMYTH, ALBERT HENRY. The Writings of Benjamin Franklin. Macmillan & Co.; 10 volumes.
- TOTTEN, CHARLES A. L. The Seal of History. New Haven, 1897; 2 volumes.
- ZIEBER, EUGENE. Heraldry in America (pp. 94-103). Philadelphia, 1909. (Based wholly upon the account by Gaillard Hunt.)

## ARTISTIC TRANSLATION AS AN AID TO ENGLISH COMPOSITION

By T. L. BOUSCAREN, S. J.  
St. Louis University

A translation from Latin to English merits the name artistic if it combines idiomatic correctness and minute accuracy with a certain beauty of expression. Correctness and accuracy together, as every Latin teacher knows, are difficult enough to attain in the classroom. Is beauty then to be entirely despaired of? On the contrary, this crowning glory of English style is in itself easier of attainment than the two more fundamental qualities, provided only that it be distinctly envisaged as one of the aims of the Latin class. Correctness, accuracy and beauty of expression — *in English* — these are high attainments; yet they lie right in the path of the Latin teacher, if only he aim at them through artistic translation.

### I

Correctness, first. It is hard to extirpate from the English version those Latinisms, — “these things having been said,” “which when he had heard,” and all their tribe. Yet these monsters must be exterminated to the very last gasp. Here patience and perseverance are the indispensable conditions of success.

Next, accuracy. Perhaps a still more toilsome task confronts the teacher who would make the student take the mechanical pains that are necessary to produce an accurate English rendition of the sense of a Latin passage. The pains required of the student himself for this work are very considerable; but the result, forceful English, is worth the trouble. Let us take as an illustration of this process a sentence from Livy, Book XXVIII, Chapter XII. He says, speaking of the province of Spain:

“Itaque ergo, prima Romanis inita provinciarum, quae quidem

continentis sint, postrema omnium, nostra demum aetate, ductu auspicioque Augusti Caesaris perdomita est."

Now a student may read this sentence over several times before grasping its import quite to the full. Yet it contains few if any unusual words; "perdomita" is about the only word he may have to look up. But the very structure of the sentence, the masonry itself as well as the individual stones, is made by its careful architect to bear its part of the meaning of the whole. So let the student read and reread the sentence until he truly understands Livy's thought. Thus far he has used and improved his knowledge of Latin, but has benefited his English only indirectly. All the succeeding steps, however, — and they are many and difficult — offer direct and thorough discipline in English. When he begins to put down the sentence in English he finds many misfits. "And so the first of the provinces to be entered by the Romans, which belong to the continent. ." will not do, because "which" refers, not to the Romans, but to the provinces. He tries again: "The first of the provinces, at least of those which belong to the continent, to be entered by the Romans,;" but this will not do, because it is not the continent that is entered by the Romans. At last he hits upon the plan of placing his prepositional clause first, an inversion which is not without its value as a device of English style; and he writes: "And so, of all the provinces, at least of all those which are on the continent, the first to be entered by the Romans was completely conquered last of all, in our own times, under the leadership and influence of Augustus Caesar." This is good; yet he should not be quite satisfied. The last part of the sentence is a little weak. Certainly it does not contain so strong an antithesis as is expressed in Livy's sentence between "prima inita provinciarum" and "postrema omnium perdomita est." To preserve this balance which gives the sentence its flavor, another resource of English style must be drawn upon. The structure must be made to diverge a little farther from the Latin structure in order that the meaning may be expressed more accurately, or at least that the tone may be more closely reproduced. He now writes: "And so, of all the provinces, at least of all those on the continent, the first to be entered by the Romans

was the last of all to be conquered in our own time under the imperial direction of Augustus Caesar." But alas, the sentence is still faulty, perhaps worse than before; for Livy does not say that Spain was the last province to be conquered in our own time under Augustus, but that it was the last province to be conquered, and that it was conquered under Augustus. It seems as though the student's troubles would never end; but he is near victory. He writes again, and it is the final draft of the sentence: "And so, of all the provinces, at least of all those on the continent, the first one to be entered by the Romans was the last of all to be completely subdued, as it finally was in our own time, under the imperial direction of Augustus Caesar." This is a good English sentence. It translates Livy's idea accurately; it is correct English, both in word and idiom; and it preserves to some extent at least the tone and balance of the original.

Some work of this kind, painful and difficult as it is, has its reward in teaching students the dignity of an English sentence. They learn that it is not a nondescript pile of words jumbled together in any old fashion, but that it is a very clean-cut, carefully built, delicately adjusted instrument of expression, that can be produced only by labor and true artistic sense. If it is worth while to teach this very same fact about Latin sentences, why is it not equally or even more important to apply the lesson to our mother-tongue?

## II

If a student of Latin has been thus laboriously trained to conscientious adherence to correctness and accuracy in translation, a firm foundation has been laid for a strong and clear English style. The step that remains to be taken for the formation of an elegant style, that is the acquirement of a certain polish and beauty, is comparatively easy, for the reason that it is less irksome and far more interesting.

There is a serene, crystalline beauty in English, — in Newman's style at its best for instance, — which is the perfect blossoming of the union of purity and power, and which defies conscious imitation. I do not pretend that this can be acquired by mere

translation, however painstaking. Unconscious steps toward it are certainly made, however, in every careful translation from the classics. And there are also lesser beauties, charms of a lower degree, yet no more embellishments but genuine merits of style, which can be directly attained. I mean especially those ways of expression which make up the quality of interest.

Books on English Composition try to ferret out the sources of an interesting style. They admit that interest depends partly on the subject-matter; but they show that it depends partly also on the manner of expression. It is aided by all that stimulates the imagination or the emotions. It resides in concrete and specific words, in imaginative expressions, pen-pictures, flashes of color, figures, comparisons and so on. Now as a model of picturesque style, it would be hard to find a writer in any language who surpasses Livy. He is simply an enthralling story-teller, not only because his facts (or inventions!) are entertaining, but because he has a gripping way of detailing them. Certainly the English language is as powerful a medium of vivid narrative as the Latin; and while it is an excellent thing to make the students feel the charm and the force that thrill through Livy's own words, it is surely an even greater achievement to make them produce English that has charm and force. Such English, though it be a translation, will become their own; and they will have learned, not exactly from the Latin author, but through him, how to write interesting English while reading interesting Latin.

A good practical method in the class-room is to assign each day, even when a complete written translation is not required, a number of typical Livian expressions taken from the lesson, which are to be put not merely into English but into English that has the living quality of the original Latin. The student's first attempts will usually bear amendment, but the practise tends to develop the knack of vivid expression. The field is almost unlimited. Here are a few specimens culled at random from Livy:

*Ruinae maxime modo jumenta cum oneribus devolvebantur.*

The pack-animals with their loads tumbled down the slope like bricks from a crumbling wall.



Cum segniter agmen incederet,  
As the column sluggishly got under weigh,

(Cum) pigritiaque et desperatio in omnium vultu emineret,  
Whilst lassitude and dejection were stamped on every face,

Mirari se quinam pectora semper impavida repens terror invaserit.

What panic could suddenly have stormed the citadel of their stout hearts?

Cum ab occasu solis ad exortum intenderent iter,  
On that long march from Gibraltar to the Alps,

Utraque simul objecta res oculis animisque immobiles parumper eos defixit.

The sight of these two movements and the realization of their meaning held the Romans for a moment rooted to their tracks.

Cum utrimque ad certamen accensi militum animi essent,  
When the ardor of the soldiers on both sides was kindled for the fray, . . .

In almost every line of Livy there is some striking expression, a figure of speech, a picture, or a heart-thrill; color for the imagination and life for the emotions; elements of vigor for the formation of English style. All this wealth, of course, must be restrained and tempered by a cultivated taste, so as not to result in mere exuberance. This is the teacher's part.

There is also in Livy a further artistic quality which I fear is sure to be lost in translation; that is a sort of tone-color, a way the words have of suggesting an atmosphere that fits the thought. How ominous is this last word of prelude to the massacre of the Romans at Lake Trasimene: "Poenus ubi, id quod petierat, clausum lacu ac montibus et circumfusus suis copiis habuit hostem, signum omnibus dat simul invadendi." And how sharp and business-like is the very sound of this, describing the first meeting between hostile forces near the Ticinus: "Consistit utrumque agmen et ad proelium sese expediebant." What though the student may not always succeed in reproducing this thrilling qual-

ity in his English translation, he can at any rate scarcely fail to fall under its spell; and he will thus become at least a seeker after beauty of expression in his own tongue.

### III

But if the full potentiality of Latin translation for the building of English style is to be realized, one further step in the method of teaching is necessary. Obviously, in order to reap the benefits already spoken of, it is essential that the student write and rewrite English versions of Latin passages; for it is only by writing that habits of expression are fixed. But unless he has more-over some model English version that is correct, accurate and beautiful, in other words unless he has at hand a truly artistic translation with which to compare his own work, he will have no objective standard by which to correct and improve himself. This is a practical difficulty because few teachers would care to put into the hands of their pupils an English translation of the Latin author that is being read in class. It is true the students do succeed in getting translations, and very bad ones at that, the ubiquitous "ponies". Still we are not prepared to recognize in principle the use of English versions in the ordinary work of translation. Yet for our particular purpose, they are essential.

The only solution is to have separate selections for this intensive practise in artistic translation. The passages chosen should be short, varied and interesting; and the model English versions should be truly masterful. If one reflects on these requisites one must admit that they are not easily satisfied. The most important of them all is that the English be really beautiful. For this reason the best way seems to be to select *English* passages from any of the real masters of English style, Addison, Irving, Stevenson, Macaulay, Newman, Chesterton and others; translate these into elegant Latin; and then let the students re-translate, and compare their versions with the original English. If a teacher has not the time — and much of it is needed — for making really elegant Latin versions of these passages, he may do what some hard-pressed teachers have done; that is, use the key to some really good

hand-book of Latin Composition. This is an inversion of the use for which the book was intended; but what of that? Necessity has simply brought forth another magnificent invention; that is all. The book containing the English passages was intended to be given to the students in the first place, and the key containing the Latin was to be kept by the teacher. You simply give the students the key — it is their hand-book; — and you keep the book — it is your key — until they are ready to compare their finished work with the models there contained.

There is certainly great satisfaction in the use of this method, because of its definiteness. If, for example, you have given your students the following Latin passage:

"Qui semel ambulandi laborem vel remigandi diutius subiit, is, quoniam totos dies sub dio erat, corporis continuata, mentis intermissa exercitatione, veram tranquillitatem animi et securitatem novit. Quibus enim cerebri semel acquievit agitatio, ii quietiore solent et temperatiore iudicio uti; iis parvae res satis magnae esse, magnae non amplius vastae et immanes videntur; ii denique humanarum rerum conditionem, qualis est, talem laeti approbant."<sup>1</sup>

. . . it is with a feeling of finality that you are able to present to them for the improvement of their work, the clear excellence of Robert Louis Stevenson's own words:

"Every one who has been upon a walking or a boating tour, living in the open air, with the body in constant exercise and the mind in fallow, knows true ease and quiet. The irritating action of the brain is set at rest; we think in a plain, unfeverish temper; little things seem big enough, and great things no longer portentous; and the world is smilingly accepted as it is."<sup>2</sup>

This is the kind of passage that I regard as ideal for our present purpose. Let me give another example of a slightly different kind, and I have done. The Latin version is:

"Illa vita rustica in Scandia adhuc redolet nescio quid auream illam majorum nostrorum aetatem, dignissimam quae vel versibus

<sup>1</sup> Key to "A Practical Course in Latin Composition," by James A. Kleist, S. J. (Loyola University Press, Chicago, 1914).

<sup>2</sup> "A Practical Course in Latin Composition," by James A. Kleist, S. J.

celebretur; tam late enim quaedam prope antiqua simplicitas, quoddam prope antiquum silentium et tranquillitas illam septentrionalem regionem pervadit. Vix urbem praeteriveris et statim, tamquam Circe imperante, omnis in prospectu situs in vastam silvarum imaginem immutatur. Circa undique sunt luci pinorum quarum rami, supra diffusi, flabellorum modo dependent, musco tecti et rubris caeruleisque conis gravati. Sub pedibus autem folia flava coniecta stragulum faciunt: calidum caelum et molle. Ligneo ponte trajicitur rivulus perlucidis undis decurrens; inde in rus dulcissimum prodit, sole et villis splendens; septa, lignis contexta, circumjacentes agros dividunt; in itinere quae obstant portae a coetibus puerorum aperiuntur. Rustici autem, si qui tibi obviam veniunt, capita praetereunti aperiunt, atque si sternueris pacem Dei adorabunt. Quicquid est aedium in vicis atque oppidulis trabibus dolatis aedificatum atque maxima parte in rubrum colorem pictum. In diversoriis sola, segmentis pineis tecta, suaves odores exhalant. Ceterum in vicis plerisque neque diversorium est; rustici autem singuli cum benignitate accipiunt eos qui forte venerunt."<sup>3</sup>

The passage loses none of its beauty when read in the English of Longfellow:

"There is something patriarchal still lingering about the rural life in Sweden, which renders it a fit theme for song. Almost primeval simplicity reigns over that northern land; almost primeval solitude and stillness. You pass out of the gates of the city, and as if by magic the scene changes to a wild woodland landscape. Around you are forests of fir; overhead hang the long fan-like branches trailing with moss and heavy with red and blue cones. Under foot is a carpet of yellow leaves; and the air is warm and balmy. On a wooden bridge you cross a little silver stream; and anon come forth into a pleasant and sunny land of farms. Wooden fences divide the adjoining fields. Across the road are gates which are opened by troops of children. The peasants take off their hats as you pass; you sneeze, and they cry 'God bless you.' The houses in the villages and smaller towns are all built of hewn timber, and for the most part painted red. The floors of the taverns are strewn with fragrant tips of fir boughs. In many

<sup>3</sup> Latin version by Mr. J. G. Smith, S. J., teacher of Latin in St. Ignatius High School, Chicago.

villages there are no taverns, and the peasants take turns in receiving travellers." <sup>4</sup>

I believe this *intensive* practise of artistic translation, judiciously used, not as a substitute for, but as a supplement to *extensive* reading of the Latin classics, has real virtue for building English style. And among the many advantages of Latin study I know of none more inspiring to the teacher than this adaptability it has for the cultivation in English-speaking youth of genuine power of expression in their own tongue.

<sup>4</sup> Quoted in "Latin Prose Composition," by Wilkins. (Longmans 1891.)



## SOME TEACHING DEVICES FOR LATIN <sup>1</sup>

By MARY HELEN ALDEN  
Struthers, Ohio

With my earliest experience in teaching Latin, I made the discovery that too much variety could not be exercised in the classroom if Latin were to be made interesting to the pupils, so I began to study ways and means for developing devices and for collecting materials with which I might put this variety of methods into action. In the material presented here I am glad to add my name to the large list of those who acknowledge their great indebtedness to Miss Frances E. Sabin, for her work in this field.

Since it is during the first year that a pupil's interest in Latin is either aroused or destroyed, a great responsibility rests with the teachers. Too much sameness of drill in forms and syntax will drive a youth to hate the name of Latin and cause him to barter his chances for a college diploma for the privilege of dropping the subject. We, the teachers, must sell our subject in such a pleasing way, that no pupil may become bored with it. Young people get tired of anything used to excess, so any device must be practiced with judgment.

In studying declensions it is essential that the case endings be recognized apart from their regular order in the paradigms. One way to accomplish this is by the use of what we call the "ring ceremony." This device consists of placing the case endings in irregular order on a circle drawn upon the blackboard. As the pointer is moved around the circle, pupils quickly name the ending. After the case has been learned then the English equivalent is given for the words formed, by adding the endings to the bases of any nouns which are placed inside the circle. Case endings of

<sup>1</sup> Read at the First Annual Meeting of the Ohio Latin Conference, November 11, 1922.

each declension, and personal and characteristic endings may be taken up in the same way.

Another means for learning quickly to recognize the case of a noun, adjective, or pronoun is a diagram giving the names of the cases, with a blank for each form. As the blank is pointed to, pupils give the Latin form. They practice locating and naming cases by this diagram until the forms for each declension can be given rapidly. Later one diagram may include all declensions.

At the beginning of the year until pupils become familiar with the various declensions it is profitable to keep in their notebooks the nouns classified, as to gender and declension, so that the association may assist in recalling where each belongs. In the same way all first and second declension adjectives ending in *us* may be grouped together; those in *er* retaining the *e*, and those in *er* dropping the *e*. Pupils become less confused when using this plan.

In order to classify the different declensions as to gender, we draw scales, showing on one side the first and fifth, feminine; the second and fourth, masculine and neuter, while the third declension on the other side balances these with all three genders. The nine consonant neuter nouns which we study in the third declension, are termed "vincofact" nouns from the initial letter of each.

Various contests may be used where classes are not too large. These should involve everybody in the recitation. Let each one have something definite to do all the time, so that he may feel that it is *his* recitation and it is *his* responsibility to keep busy. There are spelling matches, written and oral, where captains choose sides for vocabulary or derivative drill. The board may be divided with half of the class on one side, the remainder on the other. A number of English words are given for which pupils write in Latin the nominative, genitive, and gender. Mistakes are checked and the side with fewest errors stands first until the next contest. At another recitation they write on the board the greatest number of Latin words in a given time. Often there is great excitement and enthusiasm aroused by this competition. It saves time for board work to keep ready to be handed out, on slips of paper, words to decline or sentences to write out. The pupil having the

fewest errors in written work for a week stands at the head of the class. A little rivalry spurs the pupil on to more intensive study and puts a premium on accuracy. A vast amount of written drill is essential and competition acts as a stimulus, and relieves monotony.

For review, perception cards allow one to cover the greatest number of words in the shortest time. These cards may include not only the nominative case, but various forms of nouns, active and passive of verbs, phrases, and mottoes. These cards can easily be made to suit any text by using a stencil or heavy pencil on heavy sheets of paper, large enough for all the class to see. Another way to check up on vocabulary is to place on the board to be copied groups of ten words recently covered, with the most important underlined. After each fifty studied, a written test shows how well they have been learned.

Collecting pictures for important words and making a scrap-book from them is fine for junior work. Or these may be pasted on large sheets of paper and hung before the class to be used as a basis of oral or written sentences about the objects shown. For vocabulary drill the class roll may be answered occasionally by any Latin word or by one beginning with the initial of the first name.

For beginners I use the direct method quite frequently so that pupils may become familiar with the audible as well as the visible words. Dictation once in a while helps to correlate the spoken and written words and aids in spelling.

A five-minute review exercise at the beginning of the period stimulates pupils to quick thinking. This may consist of questions on constructions, principal parts or synopses of verbs which are answered by quickly passing around the class, allowing each pupil only one chance. A sentence of three Latin words may be started, after which the next pupil begins his sentence with the last word of the preceding. The pupil failing to make a sentence must drop out of the game. These give both drill in vocabulary and sentence formation.

When pupils see how many words in their daily use have a

Latin origin, Latin means much more to them. They begin to recognize a practical side to it. Consequently, much time should be spent with derivatives. Some of the more common prefixes, with their compounds, are studied carefully. Then the study of the origin of such words as sincere, viaduct, candidate, and trivial shows the pupils that "Latin is not a dead language, it has only changed its name."

For my own assistance and ready use I keep in my desk a set of filing cards of the most frequently used words in our vocabularies, with a number of derivatives from each. The cards for the lesson at hand are sorted out, from which I may quickly add to the list of derivatives that the pupils have to offer. Words of Latin origin used in geometry, civics, and science classes particularly are studied. Not only do pupils see how much our language is indebted to the Romans, but they understand how a knowledge of Latin helps in English meanings.

The advertisements of the present day show that the business world assumes that everyone should have an acquaintance with classical mythology. Since many leave school or drop Latin before Vergil, with its wealth of mythology, is read, it is well to select some of the common myths that the world expects us to know and either tell them in story form or have the class read the simplified stories in Latin. Another way to present these may be by handing these short stories or myths on slips of paper to the more apt pupils who can translate and report upon them later in class. This plan helps to meet the varying ability of pupils and interests even the dull ones.

Then pupils are asked to watch for Latin words and classical allusions in their daily reading. Those found are brought to class and placed on the bulletin board. Other items of interest, such as state and college mottoes, customs of Roman life or cartoons may be posted from time to time. These attract the attention not only of the Latin pupils, but others as well and help to interest them outside of school in stories that deal with Roman life. I encourage pupils to read such books as "Ben Hur" and "Last Days of Pompeii." A book which proves popular with

second-year pupils is A. C. Whitehead's "Standard Bearer." One boy came early to read it before school, another reported that he had read it twice. In making the pupils feel that the Romans were civilized human beings, not imaginary savages, we are accomplishing a great task. This can most effectively be realized by offering parallels between ancient and modern times. To learn that the Romans had the custom at weddings of throwing a torch to the lucky, as a bridal bouquet is thrown in our own country today and to realize that they, too, enjoyed the amusements, riding, swimming, field sports, games of ball, dramatic performances and races, such as we enjoy, makes Latin seem more real.

Around the blackboard I place a frieze of the letters of the alphabet. After each letter is written a noun to be declined, verb to be conjugated or synopsis to write. Each pupil is asked to answer what is indicated by the letters of his own first name. In this way individual assignments can easily be made to the whole class.

A concrete way of presenting conjugations is by the use of colored tense signs. Model verbs of the regular conjugations, as they are taken up for study may be written on large sheets of paper and kept before the class. The tense signs in red stand out before the pupil's eye until there is registered in his mind the meaning and use of "tense signs." It is practical to have irregular verbs such as *sum* and *eō*, and verbs having radical changes in their principal parts such as *do* and *ferō* written out in the same way. Synopses may be shown in like manner. From the Latin Game Company of Appleton, Wisconsin, may be obtained noun, verb, and principal part games which, played like "Authors," make enjoyable variety for the pupils.

To make the stems of verbs and their uses clear, I draw a tree with three main branches, representing the stems and smaller branches, the tenses formed from each stem. Different colored chalk make these stand out in the pupil's memory.

To help in arranging the words of English to Latin sentences in proper order, practice is given by distributing to each member of the class all the words of previously prepared sentences. Each



word is written on a separate card and all the words for one sentence fastened together by a rubber band, are given to each pupil. As these words are being put together, mistakes in order are corrected, after which each pupil reads and translates his sentence.

To make freshmen think carefully before writing their Latin sentences, it is a good plan to ask them first to write the case and number over the verbs. All English to Latin should be written in class. This can be carried out most effectively where there is supervised study.

For studying such constructions as classification of nouns and subjunctive clauses, sets of cards are helpful. These cards may be arranged in groups of twelve with different colored letters for each set. On each card is a sentence with the special construction underscored. A slip with the correct answers for each card which is numbered, is kept by the teacher or captain who checks pupil's answer. Competition may be offered by half of the class working on one set, while the rest are doing another.

When special rules are studied, pupils are asked to bring to class original sentences for illustrations. In the preparation of these careful thought must be given to the meaning of the rule so that examples are not learned by rote memory.

Expressions of place can best be taught by drawing a square to represent a town, indicating by arrows and Latin prepositional phrases in and around the square, the construction necessary.

Now and then the monotony may be broken by introducing a Latin poem or song or by making a pun on a Latin word, such as, "How do *men* feel after a hard day's work?" "What does one *hope for* in a crowd?" or a conundrum, as, "How is the third conjugation like an old maid?" "What girl's name may be seen on a clear night?" "What typewriter is easy to carry around?"

It is said that there are just two classes of pupils who ask questions, the very stupid and the few brilliant, while the large middle class is afraid to ask questions lest it appear stupid. In order to reach this middle class questions requested from all the pupils are put in a question box, and discussed in class on a certain day each week.

All of us are inclined to become lazy and lag without some impetus to drive us on. Especially is this true of pupils. Written reviews each week keep the pupils from becoming careless in their study and shows them how they stand in their work. To the teacher they serve to point out the weak spots and those forms which demand extra drill. Pupils feel a pride of achievement in these reviews and strive to keep up the quality of their work in order to receive good grades.

There is endless pleasure and profit in preparing a scrapbook or an exhibit based upon the outline and suggestions which Miss Sabin has offered in her "Relation of Latin to Practical Life," with which all Latin teachers should be familiar.

I have found the "Kingsley Outline Studies" valuable in suggesting helps for Caesar, Cicero, and Vergil. Game's "Teaching High School Latin" is a very good manual to keep at hand.

In the Caesar class pupils like to write the lesson occasionally as a newspaper article, with attractive headlines. It makes the subject matter more real when given a modern setting.

Questions given out with the assignment of the advance Caesar and Cicero lessons often aid pupils in getting the thought more clearly. Sometimes they are requested to write out answers to these in Latin, as drill in composition.

Experience has taught me that Latin teachers take for granted too much knowledge of English on the part of pupils. With every incoming freshman class, I am appalled at the ignorance of English grammar exhibited. After laboring for some time with a pupil and indirect discourse, he informed me that he did not know an infinitive in English. Since then I have made sure from the beginning that everyone was familiar with that construction. Indirect discourse seems to clarify itself somewhat, if several pupils go before the class, one of whom says something like this, "I am going to town." The second turn to the third and says, "John says that he is going to town." The third then says, "John says himself to go to town." After a number of such sentences have been given in English, pupils see the changes which take place from the direct to the indirect quotation and are then ready

to express the statement in Latin. If we take up only one tense of the infinitive at a time, using both active and passive forms, we succeed better.

To distinguish gerunds and gerundives, I state the following facts under each:

<i>Gerund</i>	<i>Gerundive</i>
verbal noun	verbal adjective
active	passive
neuter	all genders
four cases	all cases
singular	both numbers
takes object	modifies a noun

In this way it is shown that no doubt should arise except in the forms ending in *i, ō, um*. Then it is necessary to look for another word in the same construction.

Vergil can be made very interesting by keeping a scrapbook. From the subject matter it easily adapts itself to this device. It is best worked out by books, letting each one be illustrated by pictures of gods and goddesses mentioned in that particular book, references to subject matter in English literature, figures of speech and syntax, famous paintings of scenes described and any other material suggested by the context. Pictures have a storehouse of entertaining and instructive material within their borders and play a great part in teaching, therefore those in the texts and any which can be obtained that will help to explain some fact should not be overlooked.

The chief thing to remember in Latin teaching is not to stick too long to the same method of procedure. Avoid the monotonous as much as possible. The more varied the teaching, though some devices may seem simple indeed, the greater the chances of reaching the goal. After forms and syntax have become familiar, then it is our endeavor to have pupils get the thought which the Latin words express. Having the thought we must require that it be stated in the best idiomatic English possible. Then only shall we have good results in Latin teaching.

## Notes

### ON FOSSIL THUNDERSTONES AND FINGERSTONES

In an interesting book by C. Blinkenberg, *The Thunderweapon in Religion and Folklore*, pp. 76-85, there are given many illustrations of the belief among the peasantry of Europe that certain kinds of fossils are thunderstones. The widely scattered regions in which the name thunderstone is thus applied would suggest a hoary antiquity for the practice. Blinkenberg, however, although he cites instances in which the Greeks gave the name to axes or celts, has no ancient parallels of the use of the name for fossils.

On pages 76-77 he gives modern examples of the application of the names thunderstones and fingerstones to belemnites. These are small elongated fossils with tapering ends that make them look like missiles, hence their name from *belemnion*, "a missile." Like the other objects called thunderstones they are supposed to have fallen during thunderstorms. They have magical properties ascribed to them, including the power of affording protection against lightning.

In Pliny, *Nat. Hist.*, Book 37, there are classed as stones a number of objects which are obviously fossils. In section 137 (cf. *Isid., Orig.*, 16.15.12.) brief mention is made of *Idaei dactyli*, 'Idaeian fingerstones,' which were so named from their being found in Crete and from their resemblance to thumbs. Were they thunderstones?

The habitation of the enigmatic Cretan Dactyls was on Mount Ida. Porphyry in his *Life of Pythagoras*, 17, says that when the philosopher landed in Crete, he betook himself to Morges, one of the Idaean Dactyls, by whom he was purified with the thunderstone (τῇ κεραυνίῳ λίθῳ). The ancient mind would have found it hard to keep dissociated the designations *Idaei dactyli*, meaning fingerstones, and *Idaei Dactyli*, referring to the fabulous creatures whose names are linked with the two mountains called Ida.

It will be recalled, too, that the Cretan Mount Ida is one of the traditional birthplaces of Zeus, the god of lightning. Since belemnites have been found in Crete at the base of this mountain (See

Captain T. A. B. Spratt, *Travels and Researches in Crete* [London, 1865], II.352), one is tempted to see in them the Idaean fingerstones of Pliny and the thunderstone used in the mystic rites.

Pliny (37.135), undoubtedly using Greek sources, mentions several kinds of thunderstones, one of which is elongated. This adjective is very pertinent to belemnites. Pliny speaks of another kind (which, however, may have differed in locality rather than in character) that was rarely met with and was much in demand for the practice of magic. It was never found in a place that had not been struck by lightning.

It would seem, therefore, that in antiquity, too, belemnites were called thunderstones and fingerstones.

Some of the thunderstones mentioned by the ancients may have been fossil sea-urchins, the magical use of which in modern Europe seems to be far more prevalent than is the case with belemnites (See Blinkenberg, *op. cit.*, pp. 77-85). Parkinson, *Organic Remains of a Former World*, III.9, does in fact regard *brontea* (See Pliny, 37.150), *ombria* (See Pliny, 37.176) and *ceraunii lapides* as fossil sea-urchins, but he does not give his reasons for doing so. The fact that they were supposed to have fallen during thunderstorms is not in itself conclusive evidence for such an identification, however antecedently probable it may be.

EUGENE/S. MCCARTNEY

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

### THE ODES OF HORACE AS FRESHMAN LATIN

With great satisfaction I read in the December number of the *Classical Journal* the pleas for the Odes of Horace as Freshman Latin, and wish strongly to endorse it. Indeed, of all the Latin literature, none in my opinion makes so strong an appeal to the young American of today as Horace, with, perhaps, Cicero's *de Officiis* as a distant second. Though for over forty years life has carried me into other fields of activity, I still enjoy with undiminished pleasure Horace's poems.

Incidentally, it is a liberal education to the boy to realize from this *monumentum aere perennius* the true value of things, compared with our generation's false gods. How Maecenas, *atavis editus regibus*, survived the ages merely as a type, by the grace of the *libertino patre natus*; how Horace promises immortality to *fons Bandusiae* —



and keeps the promise, for here, after nearly twenty centuries, in far away Atlantis, we read his immortal work.

In reading Horace, I would urge a liberal memorizing of selected poems: the pretty little appeal *Ad Leuconoen*; the old college song, *Integer vitae*; the spring song, *Solvitur acris hiemps*; *Beatus ille qui procul negotiis*; the *Carmen Saeculare*, which so impressed one of the great popes that he after nineteen centuries wrote a second *Carmen* in true Horatian style; the pretty meter of *Miserarum est neque amori*, and many others.

However, I do not agree with Mr. Mierow in the difficulty which he sees in the prosody. I would not devote any time to it except perhaps later on, after greater familiarity has been acquired by reading and memorizing. Then it may be of interest to devote some time to the interesting relation between the meter and the psychological appeal made by it. In the grade schools, at a much earlier age, poems are read and memorized by the children without prosodic preparation. The same can be done with Horace, and the Horatian verse falls so easily in reading, that you can hardly miss it, and certainly no more than a diagram of the meter should be necessary for the slowest pupil.

CHARLES P. STEINMETZ  
Chief Consulting Engineer  
General Electric Company

SCHENECTADY, N. Y.

#### PRIEST-KINGS

It is generally recognized that the king archon at Athens and the *rex sacrorum* at Rome, with their purely religious functions, were survivals from a time when priests were also kings. Revolution drove the ruler from the throne but not from the altar. That the same religious conservatism still obtains is evident from a headline in the daily papers of Nov. 4th: KEEP DETHRONED SULTAN HEAD OF MOSLEM CHURCH.

CLYDE MURLEY

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY

## Current Events

---

[Edited by Clarence W. Gleason, Roxbury Latin School, Boston, Mass., for territory covered by the Association of New England and the Atlantic States; Daniel W. Lothman, East High School, Cleveland, Ohio, for the Middle States, west to the Mississippi River; George Howe, the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, North Carolina, for the Southeastern States; Walter Miller, the University of Missouri, Columbia, Mo., for the Southwestern States; and Franklin H. Potter, the University of Iowa, Iowa City, Iowa, for the territory of the Association west of the Mississippi, exclusive of Louisiana and Texas. News from the Pacific Coast may be sent to Miss Julianne A. Roller, Franklin High School, Portland Ore., and to Mr. Walter A. Edwards, Los Angeles High School, Los Angeles, Cal. This department will present everything that is properly news—occurrences from month to month, meetings, changes in faculties, performances of various kinds, etc. All news items should be sent to the associate editors named above.]

### California

*Los Angeles.*—On Friday, January 19, was held the annual banquet of the Latin Club of the Los Angeles High School. About sixty guests, all wearing the garb of ancient Rome, sat down in the school cafeteria to a truly Roman feast. Place cards bore the Latinized names of the guests, and the menu, likewise in Latin, roused the liveliest anticipations—or should I say curiosity?—as to what was in store. Offerings were made in due form to the gods of the household, the magister bibendi, Mellier Scott, crowning the mixing bowl and uttering an invocation compounded from Vergil and other sources; and an elaborate program including songs, dances, jugglers' tricks and recitations was given. Toasts were responded to by the principal of the school, Mr. W. H. Housh, the president of the Club, Miss Virginia Hyde, and the head of the Latin Department, Dr. W. A. Edwards. Mr. Housh spoke of the inheritance we have received from Rome and the additions we have made to this. Miss Hyde ventured the guess that the Trojans, amused in after years to remember the feast on the storm-beaten coast of Africa, would be much more amused if they could behold the revels of this evening. Dr. Edwards after a few sentences in Latin relapsed into English, assuming that his cultured hearers were proficient in that foreign tongue.

After singing "America" in the familiar Latin version the company adjourned.

The efficient committees which carried the affair to a successful issue were under the general direction of Miss Grace McPherron of the Latin Department.

The December meeting of the Classical Association of the Pacific States, Southern Section, was held at Los Angeles in connection with the session of the California Teachers' Association. President R. B. Von KleinSmid of the University of Southern California gave a scholarly and convincing address on the contribution which the classics must make in the reconstructed curriculum of the future.

#### Illinois

*Chicago.*—The Undergraduate Classical Club of the University of Chicago has again given proof of its vitality and has shown that it is a going concern. On March 2 it gave a very creditable presentation of the *Iphigenia in Tauris*. The lines had been well mastered and the actors entered into their parts with spirit. Gilbert Murray's translation was used.

On March 3 the Graduate Classical Club of the University varied its usual form of meeting by giving a Modern Greek program. The program was genuine modern Greek in all respects, participated in by Greeks, in Greek dress, with Greek singing and dancing and other features.

#### Indiana

*Mishawaka.*—An interesting and lively little paper is *Mercurius*, issued by the Latin Department of Mishawaka High School. Miss June Eddingfield who has had charge of the Latin there for some time, has supervised the editing of this paper by the pupils and now sends word of a general offer the Mishawaka students make to the readers of the *Classical Journal*. The second number of *Mercurius* will be ready for distribution on March fifteenth. Copies will be sent on request, as long as the supply lasts, on receipt of a stamped, self addressed envelope. If like the first issue, this second *Mercurius* will be worth seeing.

#### Iowa

*Iowa City.*—The fifth annual conference of Latin teachers of Iowa was held at Iowa City, February 9-10, 1923. The session for the college teachers of Latin and Greek was held Friday morning. Professor B. H. Skahill, Columbia College, Dubuque, read a paper

on the Latinity of St. Augustine's Confessions. He listed by groups and explained historically the departures from classical standards found in St. Augustine's work. "The American School at Athens and the Recovery of Antiquity" was the subject of an inspirational address by Professor Weller of the State University. With the help of lantern slides Professor Weller spoke of the research work in archaeology done by American scholars. Professor C. O. Denny of Drake University then read a paper on the teaching of Latin composition in which he treated of the various methods, aims, standards, and results of courses in the writing of Latin in high school and college. Mrs. Helen L. Million, Des Moines University, read an appetizing paper on food materials of the ancient Romans. This was a continuation of the paper which Mrs. Million read at the meeting of the Classical Association at Madison last spring. The session then resolved itself into a round table to discuss the placing of the emphasis in the teaching of advanced reading courses in Latin and Greek. This discussion was led by Professor F. J. Miller of the University of Chicago.

On Friday afternoon the session was opened by an address by Professor T. J. Kirby of the College of Education in the State University. Professor Kirby's paper, based on statistics gathered by the College of Education, showed that the position of Latin in the Iowa high schools is assured. Professor J. S. Magnuson of the department of Latin and Greek in the university then presented statistics from the bureau of recommendations showing the demand for Latin teachers in 1922, which was far in excess of the supply.

Taking for his subject "What did an Ancient Roman Think about?" Professor C. L. Robbins of the College of Education emphasized the vital relations existing between ancient and modern thought. This was followed by an address on "The Model Latin Teacher" by Professor F. J. Miller, in which he discussed personality, preparation, methods, and ideals. The last topic in the afternoon session was "New Phases of an Old Problem: Second Year Latin." The problem and some suggested solutions were presented by Professor Potter of the university, after which Miss Nellie E. Wilson of the North High School, Des Moines, reported in detail on the plan now being tried in the Des Moines city schools, in accordance with which Caesar is begun in the fourth semester.

One of the most enjoyable events of the conference was the in-

formal dinner at the Burkley Hotel. The menu was printed in Latin, and Latin songs were mingled with the wit and wisdom that followed the courses.

Friday evening Professor Louis E. Lord of Oberlin College delivered an illustrated lecture on Greece before a large audience. After the address the Classical Club of the university held a reception for the visiting teachers and presented Miss Harriet Vierck, dressed as a Roman matron, who recited dramatically in Latin the part of Amaryllis from Vergil's eighth Eclogue. Miss Vierck acted out all the ceremonies involved in the poem with appropriate stage properties, including Daphnis, who appeared just at the right moment, dressed in a Roman toga.

The first paper on Saturday morning was by Professor Lord, who discussed the traditional course in Cicero and offered suggestions for a more interesting and more representative course in this author. Professor Miller followed with an address on "Some Inspirational Methods in the Teaching of the Aeneid." He suggested that this work be studied as a whole and as an epic of nationalism, rather than confining the attention to the story element of the first six books.

The conference then adjourned to the Strand Theatre to view the six-reel moving picture based on Bulwer-Lytton's "Last Days of Pompeii."

At the last session Professor Ullman of the university gave an account of the progress and results of the Classical Investigation. Miss Lillian Lawler, research assistant in the university, reported on the test on English "spelling-demons" given at the last conference.

During the conference there was on exhibition in the classical library a collection of papers, notebooks, pamphlets, and charts illustrative of methods and results of work in classroom and Latin clubs. The attendance and interest were such that the department is already making plans for next year's conference.

#### **Kansas**

*Pittsburg.*—At the Latin Round Table of the section of the Kansas State Teachers' Association held in Pittsburg, the Latin Department of the senior high school presented a pageant based upon the one described in the *Classical Journal* for November, 1921.

Mother *Ducere*, dressed in the garb of a Roman matron, gave the presentation speech. Then came thirteen girls representing thirteen



prefixes, which were printed in large type on a card worn by each girl.

Next came three groups of girls representing respectively the English, French, and Spanish derivatives of *ducere*. One girl from each group made a presentation speech to Mother *Ducere* in the tongue which she represented.

The Latin and English groups then sang a song which they had composed, using the chorus of "The Shiek" as the air. This was followed by the French and Spanish versions. Then the three groups sang the song in unison, each singing in his own language.

The pageant was worked up by Miss Dorothy Markham and Miss Pearl L'Heureux of the Pittsburg Senior High School.

#### **Massachusetts**

*Cambridge.*—A joint meeting of the Eastern Massachusetts Section of the Classical Association of New England and the Classical Club of Greater Boston was held at Harvard University with the following program:

A Word of Welcome, Prof. Donald Cameron, of Boston University, President of the Section; Missionaries for the Classics, Cecil T. Derry, Cambridge Latin School; The Werewolf, Frank A. Kennedy, Boston Girls' High School; Lantern talk: The Roman Province of Africa, Prof. Clifford H. Moore, Harvard University; Quomodo Vergilius Iuvenis e Fontibus Lucretianis Hausit, J. Kingsbury Colby, Milton Academy; Lantern talk: Ancient Jewelry, Stephen B. Luce.

In spite of the storm a large audience was present to enjoy the excellent program arranged by Mr. Clarence W. Gleason, Head of the Department of Ancient Languages in the Roxbury Latin School.

#### **The American School of Classical Studies at Athens**

Excavations will be conducted this spring and summer at two sites, both under the direction of the assistant director, Dr. C. W. Blegen. The first site is a prehistoric shrine or settlement on the top of Mt. Hymettus, a short dig. The second is not fully determined, but will be either at Hageorgitika or Thisbe. At Hageorgitika, near Tripolis in the Eastern Arcadian plain, there is a small mound where potsherds have been picked up which bear a close kinship with the well known neolithic wares of Thessaly. This is the most southerly point in Greece at which such neolithic remains have come to light. The site at Thisbe in Boeotia is very promising. A My-

cenaeon settlement has been observed there behind the modern village of Kakosion. The indications are that this settlement, which formed a station on the trade-route from south to north, was of considerable importance.

Conditions in Greece are not unfavorable for excavations. There is an abundance of labor due to the demobilization of the army and the great influx of refugees. Wages in drachmas have increased, but by no means enough to counterbalance the depression of the currency. Reports of disturbances and disorder, such as have appeared in the American press, are pure fabrications.

The American School at Athens and Columbia University have entered into an arrangement whereby Professor William Bell Dinsmoor of the Columbia University School of Architecture will be given leave of absence for the second half year, beginning in 1924, for a period of years, in order that he may continue his studies of the buildings on the Athenian Acropolis. During the period of this agreement Professor Dinsmoor will be Professor of Architecture at the School while retaining his position as Associate Professor in the Columbia University School of Architecture.

The appointment of Professor Dinsmoor comes at an opportune moment, for the Greek Archaeological Society has undertaken the reconstruction of the Parthenon, and while the scaffolding is in place the whole building can be measured and subjected to minute study as never before. The researches of the Director, Dr. B. H. Hill, on the Older Parthenon are well known; when Professor Dinsmoor completes his study of the building of Pericles, we should have at last a definite publication of the Parthenon. Professor Dinsmoor's publication of the Propylaea will, it is expected, be ready for the press during his first period of residence in Athens under this agreement.

Contracts are now being let in America for the material needed for the construction of the Gennadeion in Athens. It is hoped that shipment may be made by May, and that the actual work of the building will be undertaken before summer.

The Endowment Committee had secured up to March 1, approximately \$125,000 of the \$150,000 required in order to meet the conditions under which the Carnegie Corporation and Mr. Rockefeller have subscribed an additional \$200,000. It is expected that the whole amount will be raised before the close of the academic year.

**Announcement from the Secretary's Office**

We wish to acquire the following numbers of the *Classical Journal*:

- Vol. I — All 7 numbers.
- Vol. II — Nos. 1, 2, 3, 5, 6 and 7.
- Vol. III — Nos. 2, 3, 4, 5, 7 and 8.
- Vol. IV — Nos. 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8.
- Vol. V — Nos. 1, 2, 3, 6.
- Vol. VI — No. 6.
- Vol. VII — Nos. 2, 3, 4.
- Vol. VIII — Nos. 2, 3, 6.
- Vol. IX — Nos. 3, 8.
- Vol. X — No. 1.
- Vol. XI — Nos. 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 9.
- Vol. XIII — Nos. 1, 2, 3.
- Vol. XIV — No. 5.
- Vol. XV — Nos. 1, 2, 3, 8.
- Vol. XVII — Nos. 1, 2, 3, 6.

The following numbers are in stock and may be purchased at the office of the secretary:

- Vol. III — No. 6.
- Vol. V — No. 8.
- Vol. VI — Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9.
- Vol. VII — Nos. 5, 6, 7, 8, 9.
- Vol. VIII — Nos. 1, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9.
- Vol. IX — Nos. 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9.
- Vol. X — Nos. 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9.
- Vol. XI — Nos. 4, 8.
- Vol. XII — Nos. 1-9 complete.
- Vol. XIII — Nos. 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9.
- Vol. XIV — Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 7, 8, 9.
- Vol. XV — Nos. 4, 5, 6, 7, 9.
- Vol. XVI — Nos. 1-9 complete.
- Vol. XVII — Nos. 4, 5, 7, 8, 9.

## Hints for Teachers

By B. L. ULLMAN  
University of Iowa

[The aim of this department is to furnish high-school teachers of Latin with material which will be of direct and immediate help to them in the class-room. Teachers are requested to send questions about their teaching problems to B. L. Ullman, Iowa City, Iowa. Replies to such questions as appear to be of general interest will be published in this department. Others will, as far as possible, be answered by mail. Teachers are also asked to send to the same address short paragraphs dealing with teaching devices, methods, and materials which they have found helpful. These will be published with due credit if they seem useful to others.]

### Latin for English

Major Owsley, commander of the American Legion, some time ago was quoted as saying:

There are just four things that the Legion means to push, just four things that are on our standard. They are rehabilitation, hospitalization, adjusted compensation, and Americanization.

Note that every one of these words is of Latin origin, even the last one as far as formation is concerned. This is true of most English words which strike the keynote of any great undertaking.

### Parallels

Livy tells us that the Spaniards in Hannibal's army crossed rivers on inflated skins, and Suetonius says that Caesar often used the same method. A newspaper notice states that the Arab fishermen of today follow this practice.

A fine parallel to the story of Cato who began the study of Greek when an old man is furnished by a letter quoted by James O'Donnell Bennett in *The Chicago Tribune*. The letter was called forth by an appreciation of Homer written by Mr. Bennett:

I could hardly believe, as I read, that it was there on paper that must usually, of necessity, be so sordid and so sad. I've read it all—all of the "thunders of the 'Odyssey,'" and I, too, loved the scenes that the article recalls. And because I love them still I am starting in, at the age of 60, to study Greek! Not because I am not a college woman—I am—but they didn't "make me take it."

**A Request**

Surely there have been sins of commission and omission, especially the latter, in these "Hints." If you see any, will you not be so kind as to call the attention of the editor of this department to them?

**Verbs in Latin**

We are apt to stress nouns more than verbs. To do this is a mistake, in my opinion. The verb is important, not only in itself, but especially in word formation in Latin and English. Professor Lester M. Prindle of the University of Vermont has done a fine thing in getting up a pamphlet for his students on "Verbs in First Year College Latin." High school teachers will find it hardly less valuable than will college students. It lists the simple verbs in Livy, Books XXI and XXII, Virgil, *Eclogues*, and Terence, *Andria*, which occur five or more times, together with their compounds. It is shown that, in the above, 1,416 verbs occur in 10,500 forms. Of these verbs 638 are simple verbs. Verbs of the third conjugation are most numerous, those of the fourth, least numerous. There is a good discussion of prefixes. Their meanings are explained and the number of compounds in which each enters is given. The verbs are listed according to conjugation and type. The meanings are given in such a way as to show the relation of compounds to simple verbs. I noted my favorite comparison "do up" for *conficio*, but not "done for" and "done in" (English war slang) for *interficio*. The number of occurrences is given after each verb. Copies of the pamphlet (45 pages) may be obtained for 50 cents by addressing Professor Lester M. Prindle, The University of Vermont, Burlington, Vt.

No exactly analogous book for high school Latin is known to me. We have, of course, Lodge's *Vocabulary of High School Latin* for all the words, and Jenks' *Manual of Latin Word Formation* for prefixes, as well as such word lists as Browne's *Memory-test Latin Word-list*, with its groupings by frequency, but none give special attention to verbs.

**Silent Night**

Translation of "Silent Night" has reached epidemic proportions. Everyone seems to have had the same impulse at the same time. In the January "Hints" I mentioned three translations. Still another version, by Miss June Eddingfield of the Mishawaka, Ind., High



School, was published in the school's Latin paper, *Mercurius*, December 15, 1922. It is as follows:

Sacra Nox

Tacita nox, sacra nox,  
Quieta clara lux  
Circum et virginem et puerum;  
Infans divine, cape somnum,  
Puer caelestis,  
Puer caelestis.

Tacita nox, sacra nox,  
Pastores visum tremunt,  
Splendores de caelo fulgunt,  
Caelestes Alleluia canunt:  
"Christus Tutor natus est,  
Christus Tutor natus est."

**Making Caesar Interesting**

A frequent inquiry which I am called upon to answer is "How to make Latin interesting." Sometimes the question is directed specifically to first year work or Caesar, etc. Many of the "Hints" have had a bearing on this inquiry. In the December number I made a brief answer to the specific question about Caesar. The following more detailed answer was made at my request by Miss Lillian B. Lawler of the University of Iowa:

The class in Caesar may be made interesting in two ways: by work in the class proper and by work to be done outside the class.

*I. By work in the class proper.*

An interest in the story of the *Gallic War* itself may be aroused, and the habit of reading Latin for the context encouraged, by the frequent use of "thought questions." Have the class follow the story from day to day, telling it in their own words, looking for causes and effects, discussing motives, and noting Caesar's character as it reveals itself. Occasionally require the pupils to hand in thought questions of their own, and again require short papers on such subjects as "The Customs of the Gauls," "Personal Touches in Caesar's Account," "Humor in Caesar," etc.

Work on word formation and derivatives is always fascinating to pupils and is a decidedly important phase of Latin study. Take up systematically common root words and their derivatives; the prefixes and how they assimilate; the suffixes, and how they change in English. Some such book as Jenks' "Latin Word Formation" (D. C. Heath) or De Vore's "Latin Stems and English Derivatives for Second Year Latin" (Gorham Press, Boston) would be useful in this work, if you feel that you need a guide. Have the pupils keep derivative notebooks, entering important Latin root words and their English derivatives, with English definitions and illustrative sentences.

Occasionally conduct an intensive study of one root word, such as *sto* or *facio*, to find as many English words as possible from the one Latin word.

If reading Caesar grows monotonous, introduce a few easy selections from other Latin authors — Martial, Pliny, Nepos, etc. For conundrums, games, songs, and the like, see back numbers of the "Hints."

*II. By work to be done outside the class proper.*

There are several interesting books which Caesar students enjoy reading, among them Whitehead's *Standard Bearer* (American Book Co.); Davis' *Friend of Caesar* (Macmillan); White's *Unwilling Vestal* (E. P. Dutton); Johnston's *Private Life of the Romans* (Scott, Foresman & Co.); Macaulay's *Lays of Ancient Rome*; Shakespeare's *Julius Caesar*. Each student might be required to read one of these each month.

Then, if you care to do anything with handwork, you might ask each pupil to make a model, or dress a doll, or draw a chart or map, or something of the sort, each month. Dolls may be dressed as *milites*, *legati*, *imperatores*; or as Roman women, Gauls, etc. (See plates in Caesar texts for costumes.) Working models in wood of a *vinea*, *catapulta*, *pons*, etc., always appeal to boys. Charts illustrating Latin words used in advertisements, etc., such as those worked out in Miss Sabin's "Relation of Latin to Practical Life," may be made, or the same material may be used in scrapbooks. Large maps, plans of battles, etc., may be drawn and colored. The important root word studied intensively in the derivative work may be charted with its derivatives in some original way. The more of this work you do, the more will suggest itself to be done.

Once in a while you might have one of the moving picture films, such as "Julius Caesar," "Spartacus," etc., sent to your town. Slides of Roman life are also available in some states for the cost of transportation.

Most high school pupils enjoy putting on plays. A list was published in the "Hints" two years ago. [A list will be sent on receipt of a two cent stamp.]

If you have time, you might even organize a Latin club. For programs, watch the "Hints," or write for suggestions.

Or, if you have not quite enough time for a club, try an evening of "Open House" for parents and friends, with a play, an exhibit of charts, models, etc., a talk on some interesting side of Latin study, such as derivative work, private life of the Romans, etc., perhaps with slides. Something of this sort would interest the town as well as your class.

Detailed information on any of the above points will gladly be sent.

#### Latin Newspapers

In the "Hints" for February, 1922, I called attention to several school papers. A new one is the *Mercurius* published by students of the Mishawaka, Ind., High School. The first number contains the version of "Silent Night" mentioned above, several poems in

Latin and English, news items, and a skit *C. Juli Caesaris Commentarii de Ludo Football*. The concluding sentence reads:

Salluviis Tigers [the winning team] partem Britanniae praemio dedimus et statuam Diptheri [the star player] fecimus quae in Foro collocata est.

Vol. 4 of *The Latin Club Bulletin*, published by the Louisville Male High School Latin Club, is now in progress. Its articles are all in English. In the number I saw, a continued story, "Horatius after the Bridge," had the chief place. In an article called "How High is Heaven" a clever calculation shows that the Greek heaven must have been over 22,000,000 miles away, judging from the length of time it took Vulcan to reach earth after Jupiter threw him out of heaven!

#### Punning Riddles

A few punning riddles suitable for simple games were given in the "Hints" for March, 1921, and April, 1922.

The following composed by Miss Irene G. Whaley of the Oak Park, Ill., High School, were used with great success in a Latin club consisting of first year pupils. The English pronunciation is required in a few cases:

1. When *he* commanded you not to stand, what did you do? *Iussit* (just sit).
2. What kind of fish are not *good* to eat? *Boni*.
3. If you cannot find out what business *he* has carried on, what will you do? *Gessit*.
4. What vegetable is *feared* by some ignorant people? *Timetur* (tomato).
5. Do you obey when your teacher *orders* you to do so? *Iubet*.
6. Upon what possession of my dancing partner do I avoid inflicting pain? *Vito*.
7. What should a slave do? *Servus* (serve us).
8. To whom do *we* carry lunch every day? *Portamus* (poor Thomas).
9. When *he* has seen his garden going to ruin, what should he do? *Vidit*.
10. What might *the Gauls* have said when they saw Caesar's machines of war rolling toward their city walls? *Galli*.
11. What will the old darky *advise* his children to do when they go to a funeral? *Monebit* (Moan a bit).
12. What do I *give* my son when he wants to go to a show? *Do*.
13. What is a joy *to the life* of a freshman boy? *Vitae*.
14. *Behind* what did the boy stand when he snowballed his chief enemy? *Post*.
15. Who stands *in front* of the little boy and laughs at him when he weeps? *Ante* (auntie).
16. What is *safe* to do to tin horns? *Tutum*.

17. What kind of a cereal is good for man? *Homini.*
18. What *has* the boy *bought* for the baseball season? *Emit.*
19. If we have *strength*, how do we get home from school? *Vires.*
20. What did the *whole* crowd of pickaninnies say when they were too tired to walk any farther? *Totus.*
21. What did the *king* command his gardeners to buy? *Rex.*

I am dubious about No. 15, as it necessitates the English pronunciation and is apt to harm the Latin pronunciation of this particular word.

#### Questions and Answers

*What textbooks in "vocational Latin" (medical, legal, etc.) are available?*

1. Crothers and Bice, *Elements of Latin for Students of Medicine and Pharmacy*, 1897, Philadelphia, F. A. Davis Co.
2. E. Hilton Jackson, *Law-Latin, A Treatise in Latin with Legal Maxims and Phrases*, third edition, 1910, Washington, John Byrne & Co.

(Can anyone add others?)

*Is there a collection of Latin phrases and quotations in current use, more exhaustive than the appendix of an English dictionary, with English translations?*

In addition to the general books of quotations, there are the following:

T. B. Harbottle, *Dictionary of Latin Quotations, Proverbs, etc.*, Macmillan.

H. P. Jones, *Dictionary of Foreign Phrases and Classical Quotations*, 1918, Edinburgh, John Grant.

(Can anyone supplement or improve on these suggestions?)

## Book Reviews

*Römische Studien, Historisches, Epigraphisches, Literargeschichtliches aus vier Jahrhunderten Roms.* CONRAD CICHORIUS. Leipzig: Teubner, 1922. \$5.00

As the author tells us in his Foreword, these studies are fruits of twenty years' labor in the field of Roman History in its widest sense, from the age of the First Punic War to the time of Marcus Aurelius. There are sixty-five separate articles, varying in length from a single page to fifty-five pages, and arranged under the following ten groups: I. *Aus dem römischen Kultus*; II. *Aus der älteren römischen Dichtung*; III. *Römisch-Spanisches*; IV. *Historische Inschriften der republikanischen Zeit*; V. *Historische Studien zu Varro*; VI. *Aus der römischen Gesellschaft der ausgehenden Republik*; VII. *Aus dem Kreise des Augustus*; VIII. *Römisches aus der griechischen Anthologie*; IX. *Historische Persönlichkeiten und historische Dokumente aus dem Jahrhundert nach Augustus*; X. *Literargeschichtliches zu Autoren aus der Zeit der Claudischen Kaiser*. There is a good index and a chronological table. As it is impossible even to mention the titles of all the various studies here, I shall content myself with illustrating their general character from four representative selections. In *Staatliche Menschenopfer* (I, pp. 7-20), the author shows that the sacrifice of a Greek and a Gallic pair of human victims was not a Roman war sacrifice, but a sacrifice of atonement, performed to expiate the impiety of a Vestal. As the reason for the selection of victims of this particular type, it is suggested that the sacrifice was originally an Etruscan war sacrifice, adopted by the Romans under the influence of Etruscan haruspices as an expiatory sacrifice in 228 B. C. *Zwei Dokumente zur Agrargeschichte der Revolutionszeit* (IV, pp. 113-24) contains interpretations of CIL. VIII, 12,535 and X, 44. The former inscription, from Carthage, contains parts of the names of a commission of triumvirs. This list is restored as that of the Gracchan III *viri agris assignandis dandis* in office during the years 120-119 B. C. The latter, from Vibo, in



the text of CIL. X, additamenta p. 1003, is a fragmentary list of names headed by one of the IV *viri* of the municipality. In the following names Cichorius sees part of the commission of X *viri agris dandis assignandis*, created by Livius Drusus in 91 B. C., whose names have been incorporated in a document subsequently erected by the municipal IV *viri*. *Die Neuordnung der Staatsämter durch Augustus* (VII, pp. 285-92) discusses the questions when Augustus made the aedileship or tribunate an obligatory qualification for the praetorship, and when the IV *viri capitales* and IV *viri monetales* of Julius Caesar were reorganized as III *viri*. By identifying the tribune Apudius of Dio LIII, 20, with the M. Ampudius of CIL. X, 6082, he arrives at 23 B. C. as the probable date of the reform of the *cursus honorum*, and by applying this result to the interpretation of CIL. IV, 2845, he shows that the reduction of the above mentioned boards of IV *viri* to III *viri* was carried out by Augustus, some time prior to 20 B. C. The study entitled *Die Aegyptischen Erlasse des Germanicus* (IX, pp. 375-388) presents the following interesting conclusions. The edict of Germanicus prohibiting excessively adulatory acclamations is directed to the populace of Alexandria, and not to all the Egyptians. It implies that the Alexandrines had saluted Germanicus as Augustus and his wife Agrippina as Augusta on account of the opening of the imperial granaries at the orders of Germanicus to relieve the famine in the city. This emptying of the Egyptian granaries in Egypt gives the explanation of the famine in Rome in 19 B. C., recorded by Tacitus, *Annals*, II, 87, and also of why, owing to the unforeseen failure of the state's reserve supplies, the otherwise unimportant *negotiatores* controlled the situation and had to be treated with great consideration by Tiberius.

The studies as a whole display a masterly knowledge of literary and epigraphical sources, a keen sense for historical problems, and sound constructive reasoning. They abundantly justify the author's dictum, which is also Mommsen's, that the student of Roman history must also be a philologist. It is to be regretted that the publishers of the book have fixed so high a price for American purchasers. They seem to overlook the fact that the American student is not identical with the American millionaire.

A. E. R. BOAK

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

*Vergil. A Biography.* By TENNEY FRANK. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1922. Pp. viii+200.

This biography is prompted by the feeling that, with recent critical studies, the importance of the *Vita* by Donatus has been much decreased and that of the *Appendix Vergiliana* much enhanced. To the author, therefore, the time seems ripe for a revaluation of the facts of Vergil's life and a new study of their significance for the interpretation of his poems. Recent studies, he remarks in his preface, have "compelled most of us to accept the *Appendix Vergiliana* at face value." Yet only the previous year Professor Radford (*Trans. Am. phil. Assoc.* 52 (1921), 157) had asserted that "the whole *Appendix*, as is shown unmistakably by the language and diction, is clearly the work of Ovid," while in 1922 Klotz (in *Hermes*, 57 (1922), 588-599) had dated the *Ciris* (one of Professor Frank's chief bulwarks) as post-Ovidian, and Witte (in *Hermes*, 57 (1922), 563-587) was denying its Vergilian authorship. At the outset, then, one has the uneasy feeling that in this book we tread the lava over fires of doubt not so thoroughly extinguished as our author enthusiastically supposes.

But granting for the sake of argument the authenticity which Professor Frank assumes, we are introduced, in an easy and fascinating account, to the young poet amid the circle of his teachers and fellows, the information being derived, for the most part, from the *Culex*, *Ciris*, *Catalepton*, and *Eclogues*. With an almost uncanny ingenuity in combination, intuition, and allegory, our author recreates a youthful Vergil so self-consistent as to be somewhat suspicious. Did the argument not flow so rapidly we might perhaps think that (p. 8) the name *Magia* was more likely the cause of Vergil's mother's being thought a *maga* than her being a *maga* the cause of her name, as Professor Frank supposes; that (p. 30) it in no way follows that Vergil in imitating Horace's second epode is acknowledging the *Culex* as his own work; that (p. 58) we do not know that the *Aetna* which Servius ascribed to Vergil was our extant work of that name; that the second chapter and the reconstruction of the *Res Romanae* (pp. 68ff.) rest too heavily on the constructive imagination; that Professor E. T. Merrill (in *Classical Philology*, 8 (1913), 389-400) had a decade ago successfully demolished the equation of *Sabinus ille* and *Ventidius* which Professor Frank continues to assume in *Catalepton*

10; and that the identification (pp. 116 f.) of Daphnis with Cornificius is unconvincing; and we might indulge in doubts at not a few other points. The suggestion that the Messianic lore of the fourth eclogue reached Vergil by way of Philodemus is interesting, and Professor Frank deserves sincere thanks for interpreting (pp. 127-128) the first and ninth eclogues as typical rather than as allegorically referring to Vergil's own experiences, yet it could be wished that he had kept equally clear from the dangerous swamps of allegory in his explanation of the *namque canebat* passage in the sixth eclogue, where his suggestion that the poet is giving us a versified syllabus, as it were, of the philosophical lectures of Siro (p. 99) is little short of comic.

Professor Frank is at his best in vivid historical reconstruction (though even here much is highly hypothetical), but less satisfactory in literary criticism, with which, to do him justice, his book is not primarily concerned. Very unconvincing, for example, is his brief treatment (p. 182) of the Dido episode, in which he quite disregards the correlations with Greek tragedy; and surely at the end of the book (which is as hurried as the termination of some of Scott's novels) an estimate of Vergil's character and achievements would have been in place.

Nor is the analysis of Vergil's philosophy to be accepted without most serious qualifications. Vergil was in his youth an Epicurean and also up to his latest work a deep admirer of the poetry of Lucretius, but neither of these undisputed facts authorizes the belief that Epicureanism was the school of his mature allegiance, nor do any of the arguments assembled by the author (pp. 182 ff.) clearly prove this. The "repetition of his creed in the first *Aeneid*" is, when examined, merely the creation song in the mouth of the African bard at the court of the Epicurean queen Dido; the "atoms of fire struck from the flint" (*Aen.* 6, 6) are but the Homeric σπέρμα πυρός; etc. These arguments I have already answered in detail in *Class. Weekly*, 15 (1921), 2-5, so that repetition may be here dispensed with, but one cannot help feeling that if Professor Frank were as familiar with Stoicism as with the Epicurean doctrine he could hardly have made some of the assertions which appear in these pages.

In conclusion it may be said that as a synthesis of the views in regard to the *Appendix Vergiliana* which the author has for some

years past in various journals been active in promulgating, the book is, for well-trained scholars, both interesting and stimulating. The layman, however, and those ill equipped to distinguish between authenticated truth and alluring hypothesis, yet desirous of finding in a biography not a provisional report of progress but a judicial presentation of those results which have stood the test of criticism and have now become common property—these, I believe, will more safely seek another guide.

ARTHUR STANLEY PEASE

UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS

*First Latin.* A Lesson a Day for a Year. By CHARLES UPSON CLARK and JOSIAH BETHEA GAME. Chicago: Mentzer, Bush and Company, new edition, 1922. Pp. viii+353.

The popular attack on Latin in recent years has caused a great change in teaching and in text books. It has brought about an effort to make Latin "practical" and worth while for those—the great majority—who study it only a year or two. Messrs. Clark and Game's *First Latin* is written with this end in view, and is an entirely new type of text. It is designed "to secure for pupils the largest possible returns" and to enable them to "catch a glimpse of the meaning of the ancient world and of its value to our modern life" (Preface, p. iii). It is the product of "years of persistent experiment and investigation in the high school, the normal school, and the college" (p. 1), and aims at interest as well as essentials. It has retained the best in traditional methods, and in addition it tries to grip the pupil's interest and sympathy by fresh unhackneyed material, gleaned largely from Cicero's letters and from Mediaeval Latin, and by pictures of the life and country of those whose language is being studied.

Many strong features commend the book—among them the division into "A lesson a day for a year," 160 lessons in all, each suited to the average class without need of revision by the teacher. This is a common sense arrangement and appeals to both the experienced and the inexperienced teacher. The lessons are planned so that a large part of the work "is to be done *in class*" (p. 4). Most of the lessons have an "optional part" for additional work, "not prepared out of class," or for diversion after a good recitation. This part consists of Latin verses, proverbs, riddles, fables, songs, sketches of ancient life, interesting conversations, brief biographies of great Romans, selec-

tions from Viri Romae, stories of Benjamin Franklin and of Benjamin West, the Ten Commandments and the Pater Noster, names of well known trees, plants, and animals, parts of the body, abbreviations, etc. This, it seems, ought to appeal to even the most indifferent pupil.

The vocabulary is large, varied, and instructive. It contains about 650 words used most frequently by Caesar and about 500 other words of common usage and interest, mainly English source words "close to the life and thinking of high school pupils" (p. 2). The relation of Latin to English is constantly emphasized. So the book not only prepares for Caesar, but does more — it vitalizes Latin and makes it "practical" for those who study it only a year. An excellent device in the vocabularies and exercises is the use of hyphens in the English equivalent of a Latin word — as "*simul* at-the-same-time," "of-the-young-man," "on-the-next-day," etc.

In syntax 35 leading constructions are presented and given commendably simple treatment. To fix the principles of syntax the old plan of memorizing "the rule and an example" is followed. Ten lessons (151-160) are devoted to "parsing" as an aid to fixing forms. Reviews are frequent, a part of almost every day's task, so closely does each lesson tie to the preceding. Monthly, quarterly, and subject review lessons further bind together all lessons completed. The illustrations are abundant, well chosen, and usually have close connection with the "optional part" of the lesson. Admirable features also are the two maps, "Italia" (p. viii) and "Ancient Rome" (p. 306), and the four Latin songs (words and music) "Lauriger Horatius," "Gaudemus Igitur," "Integer Vitae," and "Dulce Domum" (pp. 347-350).

This book carries out the methods of presenting Latin advocated by Dr. Game in "Teaching High School Latin," a widely used teachers' handbook. Those who used the first edition of First Latin are enthusiastic in its praise — as "the most teachable book ever used." Its superiority is attested by recent and impending state adoptions, by indorsements of leading classical teachers, and by the fact that other manuals are copying its plan or appropriating its material. The new edition, cleared of misprints, is most welcome.

G. A. SIMMONS

HENDRIX COLLEGE



## Recent Books

- PYM, DORA. *Readings from the Literature of Rome in English Translations*. London: Harrop. Pp. 332. 5 s.
- ROBINSON, RODNEY P. *De fragmenti Suetoniani de grammaticis et rhetoribus codicum nexu et fide*. (University of Illinois Studies in Language and Literature, Vol. VI, No. 4.) Urbana, Illinois: University of Illinois Press. Pp. 193. \$2.00.
- SHOWERMAN, GRANT. *Horace and His Influence*. (Our Debt to Greece and Rome, Vol. XIV.) Boston: Marshall Jones. Pp. xvii+176. \$1.50.
- THEOCRITUS. *Six Idyllia*, that is, Six Small or Petty Poems, or Aeglogues, Chosen out of the right famous Sicilian Poet Theocritus, and translated into English Verse. (A reprint of an early translation.) London: Duckworth. Pp. 58. 30s.
- VERGIL. *The Eclogues, Bucolics, or Pastorals of Virgil*. A revised translation, with introduction, text, and notes by T. F. Royds. Oxford: Blackwell. Pp. xiii+121. 6 s.
- XENOPHON. *Anabasis*, Books iv-vii, with an English translation by C. L. Brownson. *Symposium and Apology*, with an English translation by O. J. Todd. (Loeb Classical Library.) New York: Putnam. Pp. 522. \$2.25.
- ZIMMERN, A. E. *The Greek Commonwealth*. Third edition, revised. New York: Oxford University Press. Pp. 462. \$5.35.
- AESCHYLUS. *The Oresteia of Aeschylus*: Agamemnon, Choephoroi, Eumenides, translated by R. C. Trevelyan. Liverpool: University Press. Pp. 154. 5 s.
- AUSTIN, JAMES C. *The Significant Name in Terence*. (University of Illinois Studies in Language and Literature, VII, No. 4.) Urbana, Illinois: University of Illinois Press. Pp. 130. \$2.00.
- CHAVE, THEODORE T. *Latina latine: sive, ratio nova et liberior elementa Latina tradendi in usum scholarum*. Wagoner, Oklahoma: Wagoner Tribune. Pp. ii+117.
- The Claim of Antiquity*, with an annotated list of books for those who know neither Latin nor Greek. London: Milford. Pp. 30. 1 s.

- CONWAY, R. S. *The Making of Latin: an introduction to Greek, Latin, and English etymology.* London: Murray. Pp. ix+146. 5 s.
- CUMONT, FRANZ. *After Life in Roman Paganism.* Lectures delivered at Yale University on the Silliman Foundation. New Haven: Yale University Press. Pp. xv+225.
- HOERNLE, E. S. *The Problem of the Agamemnon*, being a criticism of Dr. Verrall's theory of the plot of Aeschylus' Agamemnon; and Dr. Verrall's reply. Oxford: Blackwell. Pp. 42. 2 s.
- HOERNLE, E. S. *The Recognition Scene in the Choephoroe: an examination of Dr. Verrall's introduction to the play, with a new solution of the problem.* Oxford: Blackwell. Pp. 28. 2 s.
- LYCURGUS. *The Speech against Leocrates*, ed. A. Petrie. New York: Macmillan. \$1.90.
- MACKAIL, J. W. *Virgil and his Meaning to the World of Today.* (Our Debt to Greece and Rome series.) Boston: Marshall Jones. Pp. x+159. \$1.50.
- OVID. *Carmina Selecta: selections chosen to meet the new requirements of the College Entrance Examination Board*, ed. F. W. Kelsey and J. W. Scudder. Boston: Allyn. Pp. vii+66. \$100.
- PILSBURY, E. H. *Latin Prose Composition for Middle and Upper Forms.* New York: Oxford University Press. Pp. 202. \$1.20.
- ROUSE, W. H. D. *Chanties in Greek and Latin*, written for ancient and traditional airs. Oxford: Blackwell. Pp. 86. 2 s. 6 d.
- SCOTT, HARRY F. *First Latin Lessons*, with selections for reading from Decem Fabulae. Chicago: Scott, Foresman. Pp. xx+304. \$1.20.
- STEVENSON, R. L. *Insula Thesauraria*, ab auctore Roberto Ludovico Stevenson: latine interpretatus est Arcadius Avellianus. (Mount Hope Classics, Vol. V.) New York: E. P. Prentice. Pp. ii+361. \$3.50.
- TAYLOR, H. O. *Greek Biology and Medicine.* (Our Debt to Greece and Rome Series.) Boston: Marshall Jones. Pp. xv+151. \$1.50.
- VIRGIL. *Aeneid*, Books I-III, partly in the original and partly in the English verse translation of James Rhoades, ed. C. E. Freeman. New York: Oxford University Press. Pp. 157. \$1.20.
- VIRGIL. *Aeneid*, Books IV-VI, partly in the original and partly in English verse translation, ed. Cyril Alington. New York: Oxford University Press. Pp. 158. \$1.20.